







|     |  |    |
|-----|--|----|
| 7.0 | Doing What Works.....                    | 63 |
| 7.1 | Summary of Lessons Learned .....         | 63 |
| 7.2 | Doing What Works in the Short-Term.....  | 64 |
| 7.3 | Doing What Works in the Longer-Term..... | 65 |
|     | Annex A.....                             | 67 |
|     | Annex B .....                            | 76 |
|     | Annex C.....                             | 77 |

## Executive Summary

This report sets out the findings from a review of existing research and program evaluations on barriers to participation in the labour market and what works in addressing these barriers. This is a background report, intended to inform the design of a labour market development strategy for the Province of Newfoundland and Labrador.

### Groups Facing Barriers

The groups included in the study were developed in collaboration with Human Resources and Employment (HRE), and are:

- youth at risk;
- youth making the transition from school to further education or the labour market;
- post-secondary students and graduates;
- women;
- persons with disabilities;
- Aboriginal people;
- persons in receipt of income support<sup>1</sup>;
- single parents (includes males and females, but the majority are female) with low income and/or in receipt of income support;
- immigrants;
- older workers; and
- workers in rural areas.

We also reviewed literature on the labour market barriers faced by employers.

---

<sup>1</sup>In some literature reviewed, this group was known as persons in receipt of social assistance.

## Scope of Literature Review

The document review was intended to be a focused, rather than an exhaustive, synthesis of the existing literature on the groups facing barriers. A separate technical report contains the details of this research (Doing What Works - A Review of Research on Barriers to Participation in the Labour Market: Background Report for the Labour Market Development Strategy, Technical Report, 2003.) The findings for each group were documented and shared with validators (20 in total) selected from among the stakeholder groups facing barriers, and lead government departments.

## Labour Market Barriers Defined

In this report, labour market barriers are defined as anything that prevents or impedes individuals, and groups of individuals sharing common characteristics, from equal inclusion and opportunity in the labour market. Barriers faced by individuals also create obstacles to achieving an efficient and effective labour market, one where the dynamics of supply and demand work well. Labour market barriers have been categorized in two ways to facilitate understanding their presentation and causes - environmental/external or personal/internal. In reality, individuals and groups may face combinations of barriers which in turn may lead to cumulative and multiple barriers that are more difficult to deal with. As well there is interplay between personal and environmental barriers that add to the complexity of individuals' needs.

## A Social Inclusion Approach to Programming

This study examines the issues of barriers to labour market participation and how to prevent and remove them, from a social inclusion perspective. Social inclusion has been defined as:

- "To be included is to be accepted and to be able to participate fully within our families, our communities and our society" (Guilford, 2001).
- "Social inclusion is the capacity and willingness of our society to keep all groups within reach of what we expect as a society - the social commitments and investments necessary to ensure that socially and economically vulnerable people are within reach of our common aspirations, common life and its common wealth" (Laidlaw Foundation, 2001).

The report discusses the values that govern the design and implementation of socially inclusive policies and programs.

## Profile of Groups Facing Labour Market Barriers

The report also sets out a short profile of each of the groups reviewed, based on key labour market indicators, the extent to which groups participate in the labour market in comparison to the overall labour force, and other relevant comparison groups, as well as indicators of the most important barriers that they face.

### Environmental/External Barriers

This category of barriers is the most prevalent across groups. These are the barriers that present the most challenges for individuals, since they often have little or no control over them. Government policies and programs play a key role in preventing or eliminating environmental/external barriers. The barriers discussed are related to:

### Transition in the Labour Market

- Lack of or limited work opportunities, even as economies improve.
- Lack of access to transition programs, which center on program design and supports, eligibility and financing, and delivery. These are barriers that many jurisdictions (including this province) have as central considerations in their labour market policies and programs, and there are ongoing efforts to design appropriate policy and program responses.

### Barriers in the Workplace

Success in obtaining entry-level jobs and then advancing in the workplace are affected by what we have classed as barriers in the workplace. These include:

- Discrimination and attitudes, underemployment and non-standard jobs, lack of work supports, and wage disparities. The impact of lack of strong employment equity, human rights, and (for persons with disabilities) barrier removal legislation are highlighted as contributors to these barriers.
- The rise in non-standard jobs, which are often poorly paid and with little or no job security.
- Underemployment - an issue for immigrants, and graduates of some post-secondary programs.
- Lack of work supports - This is critically important to the employment of people who require this form of assistance (particularly some persons with disabilities). Supports are wide ranging, from personal, through to financial, and workplace specific (Labour Market Needs Analysis, Roeher 2002; Lessons Learned, HRDC; Roeher 1996).

## Barriers in the Community

Access to the labour market is also affected by the availability of various supports and services in the community. The research reviewed highlighted three such barriers: lack of transportation, lack of accessible quality child care, and community capacity in general.

## Barriers in the Home and Family

A number of barriers can emanate from the home that have implications for public policies, including: work-home roles imbalance, which is very much a gender issue; family/social influences on career decisions; and unstable home environment.

## Personal/Internal Barriers

How well individuals fit with the labour market is also affected by what they bring in terms of personal characteristics. Some groups face multiple social and/or personal barriers that create even more significant challenges to being part of the labour market. Personal barriers discussed include:

- Employability skills - including life skills such as confidence, self-esteem, commitment, readiness, job search skills, and independence of income support.
- Adult literacy - many adults have not learned to read well enough to obtain desirable jobs, to obtain training for these jobs, and to participate fully in society in general. Adding to the problem, much of the written material used in schools and the workplace is unclear and unnecessarily complex (What Works for Whom?, HRDC, 1999).
- Mismatch of education and skills with opportunities - this can occur for all groups and all education levels. Reasons include type and level of education, work experience, particular skill sets, lack of recognition of credentials, or language skills.

Education has been found to be the key factor influencing success in the labour market and well being in society more generally. There is a clear correlation between low educational attainment and problems making transitions in the labour market - for all groups and in all sectors (Knowledge Matters, HRDC, 2002).

Equitable access to the labour market starts with equitable access to quality education. There are concerns that disadvantaged groups, those from low socio-economic groups, and rural residents in the Province do not have equitable access. A key factor in this access is the cost of education (Canadian Policy Research Networks, 2001; Why Stop After High School?, Canada Millennium Scholarships Foundation, 2002; Investing in Learning - Investing



in People, Government of Newfoundland and Labrador, 2002; Access Denied, Canadian Association of University Teachers, 2002).

- Experience - Lack of or non-relevant work experience among youth, those who have been out of the work force for a while, and those who are new to the country, is commonly cited as an obstacle to getting a first or new start.
- Skill sets - Workers who are making transitions today are doing so in a market that is rapidly changing (Knowledge Matters, HRDC, 2002).
- Credentials - The challenge for new immigrants is having their credentials recognized. Accreditation can be expensive and not readily accessible (Immigration in Canada: A meeting of federal partners, 2003).
- Health - Both physical and mental health concerns can affect participation in the labour market.
- Mobility - Older workers are often less willing or able to be geographically or occupationally mobile, while youth are more mobile for education and work, and this has implications for viability of some of the communities that they leave.

### **Lessons Learned on What Works**

The report describes what has been learned on approaches that work in tackling the many and diverse barriers described, noting that labour market programming in the Province is already incorporating many of these lessons in main stream and group-specific initiatives.

### **What Works - Generic Design Features**

- Client-centred programming - Found in programs that are inclusive (including involving participants in program design and review); flexible; tailored to needs; provide service and resource co-ordination; involve program management and culture that focus on high expectations and employment as the goal.
- Preventative approaches - The key preventative approach for all groups is improving education levels by ensuring that young people obtain a solid secondary and post-secondary education including accessible and relevant career guidance (What Works for Whom?, HRDC, 1999). One indicator of this from the provincial experience is the strong academic performance of the Fall 2002 high school graduates in their first year at Memorial University. This group is unique in that they had the benefit of writing high school public exams in both level 2 and level 3 (Rossiter, 2003).

- Remedial measures - Which in most cases are more intensive and lengthy than those in preventative programs (What Works for Whom?, HRDC, 1999).
- Comprehensive - Multi-faceted approaches are most effective in assisting groups experiencing significant barriers.
- Continuity - Programming for people experiencing significant barriers works best when conceived and funded with multi-year approaches in mind. If delivery is in the community, a clear commitment to sustainable funding is important, but lack of this is seen as one of the key weaknesses in much programming that is in place (What Works for Whom?, HRDC, 1999, SSPNL Research Report, 2002, Evaluation of NewfoundlandJOBS, 2001, KPMG, 1998).
- Linkages to good jobs - It has been shown for all groups that programming linked to work makes a difference in outcomes.
- Focus on partnerships - Clarity in roles, responsibilities and accountabilities is necessary from the outset and important to be checked periodically as the partnership evolves (Transition Processes that Work, HRDC and Conference Board of Canada, 2001).

To establish effective partnerships with the private sector, it is important for governments to *understand* the sector and their needs, think broadly in terms of their potential role, and maximize the leverage of the private sector investment (Strategic Initiatives Program: Lessons Learned, HRDC, 2000).

- Community-based - Using locally available resources and opportunities to deal with local community challenges have been found to work (Transition Processes that Work, HRDC and Conference Board of Canada, 2001).

### **What Works – Specific Transition Interventions**

- Education - There is a strong correlation between educational attainment and success in the labour market. As stated earlier, education is perhaps the key success factor for all groups. The accessibility of post-secondary educational opportunities is also a key factor to success, and is affected by the costs of tuition and other expenses. The rising debt level of students and graduates is a major concern among all those with an interest in education and the labour market.

There is evidence on what works in literacy programs, but conditions do not always exist to allow that to happen consistently or systematically (What Works for Whom?, HRDC, 1999).

- Training that is tailored to individual needs and circumstances produces better results.

- School to work transition - Holistic approaches work best in helping youth with disabilities make a successful transition from school to work (Lessons Learned from Evaluation of Disability Policy and Programs Technical Report, HRDC, 1997).
- Employment counselling and assistance - The modest benefits of these interventions offset their costs (What Works for Whom?, HRDC, 1999).
- Work incentives/supplements - Welfare-to-work programs can achieve positive results, although often modest, but they also have important limitations. They can increase employment and earnings of a broad cross-section of the income support caseload and reduce costs but those with multiple barriers are unlikely to be helped (What Works for Whom?, HRDC, 1999).
- Wage subsidies - In general, the Canadian experience with wage subsidies suggests relatively large positive impacts on employment and earnings for participants. The literature suggests that wage subsidy programs mainly redistribute job opportunities. However, the argument is made that this redistribution may be justified on equity grounds as long as the people displaced are not members of disadvantaged groups (What Works for Whom?, HRDC, 1999).
- Employment/work experience - Job creation programs offering temporary periods of work have generally failed to provide long term benefits to participants in terms of getting and keeping a job (What Works for Whom?, HRDC, 1999).
- Bridging programs - Typically bridging programs include counselling services, life skills training basic academic training, combined with job search skills, training in interview techniques, and a strong emphasis on work placements. Two successful approaches in the Province focussed on women (Women in Successful Employment (WISE), and displaced older forestry workers (The Forestry Worker Bridging Program).
- Self-employment - Studies of self-employment programs have shown the importance of combining financial assistance with other types of support, such as management training and business planning help.
- Transition to retirement - A number of approaches have been tried, with varied success to help older workers ease the transition from work to retirement, including passive income support through to active employment measures (What Works for Whom?, HRDC, 1999).

## What Works - Specific Interventions in the Workplace

- Employment standards - It is known that effectiveness of standards is enhanced by strong monitoring and enforcement mechanisms. Existing federal and provincial legislation in Canada has been criticized in this regard (Gender Equality in the Labour Market Lessons Learned, HRDC, 2002).
- Employment equity - Canadian employment equity legislation is relatively new. The effectiveness of policies that clearly state the type and magnitude of the changes expected, timetables for achievement, and penalties for non-compliant organizations is shown in annual reports on the program (Gender Equality in the Labour Market Lessons Learned, HRDC, 2002).

There is a clear international trend in all industrial, and many developing countries, to enact barrier removal legislation for persons with disabilities.

- Pay equity - Pay equity policies and legislation can be effective in reducing the gender gap in pay. Policies that narrow the overall earnings distribution narrow the gender earnings gap (Gender Equality in the Labour Market Lessons Learned, HRDC, 2002).
- Work supports - A number of studies reviewed noted features of successful programs and/or policies which acknowledge that many people may require supports in order to access programs and work. In many cases, individual programs fall short of offering the whole basket of supports needed (Strategic Initiatives Program: Lessons Learned, HRDC, 2000).
- Supported Employment model - This (usually used with persons with intellectual disabilities) has achieved a high level of consumer satisfaction and is less costly than alternatives (Lessons Learned from Evaluation of Disability Policy and Programs Technical Report, HRDC, 1997).
- Disability management and return to work strategies - Overall, success in return to work programs is increased when interventions occur early (the longer the person is away from the job the less likely to return), when a proactive case management process is used, and when there is a recognition that workplace accommodation may be necessary to enable re-entry (Lessons Learned from Evaluation of Disability Policy and Programs Technical Report, HRDC, 1997).

## What Works - For Employers

The key barriers for employers identified in this research are looming skill shortages and lack of effective workplace training strategies, as well as systemic barriers in the business environment caused by government regulation.

- Skill shortages - Employers here and in other provinces have noted that strategies to fill skill shortages include turning to groups they would not usually have hired to fill vacancies - youth, women in non-traditional occupations,

Aboriginal people, new immigrants, persons with disabilities (Canadian Federation of Independent Business, 2003, and Bristol Group, 2003).

- Workplace training - Employer commitment is an important factor to success, evidenced by those with a solid business strategy, human resource plans, and who make their commitment well known to workers (Lowe and McMullen, 1999). Human resource management skills appear to be a particular need that is not well met presently.
- Business retention and expansion - This initiative, which is being piloted in some economic zones and sectors in the Province (e.g., Information Technology) was noted in a recent regional consultation process as working well in identifying and developing strategies for business survival and growth (Bristol Group, 2003).

### **Summary of Lessons Learned**

The following learnings were identified:

- A sound education foundation is the most important driver of labour market success.
- Improved educational achievement prevents a host of problems later on.
- Program design is important - if it is worth doing, it is worth doing well.
- Inclusive approaches work - it is important to involve the groups facing barriers, as well as employers, early on in design and throughout implementation and evaluation.
- Targeting makes a difference - get to know the needs of individuals and what works for these needs, and build this into design.
- Tailoring to consumer needs and opportunities is important - labour market information is a key piece in design.
- Good quality career planning information, provided by knowledgeable people in accessible ways to students and parents, is important to ensuring cost-effective education investments.
- Assistance with education financing and debt reduction must ensure equitable access to public post-secondary education as a key step in avoiding later barriers to labour market participation.
- Realistic but fair expectations and goals are needed - some people will not move from income support to productive employment; others are held back because of low perceptions of their abilities.

A coordinated and integrated approach pays off - community delivery is probably better but government can do it if staff are focussed on participant success.

- Legislated standards, with education and enforcement, can remove barriers to work.
- Sometimes inexpensive approaches work best, but chances are programming will cost.
- Prevention (while sometimes more expensive) is worth the effort.
- Beware of deadweight and displacement effects in some programs - target and monitor.
- Link transition programs with good work.

### **Doing What Works in the Short-Term**

The following are suggested options for action in the coming months as the labour market strategy is designed.

- Include students, workers, and employers, through their advocacy groups at the design table as partners - with clear roles for them and for government, and the resources to make this partnership productive. Where possible, integrate with existing partnerships like the Strategic Social Plan.
- Use a socially inclusive approach to strategy development.
- Set realistic goals for what the strategy will achieve and, by when, in changing the face of labour force participation - based on the situation today, past experience, and realistic future scenarios for economic and labour market development.
- Signal, through the work of this partnership, how deep and wide the public policy and interventions will go: deep in terms of tailored and multi-faceted programs for people with barriers versus wide, to provide mainstream programming to people who are probably going to do okay anyway.
- Make a long- term funding commitment and strategy for program deliverers based on an accountability framework that sets out the mutual expectations of government and the deliverers, and their accountabilities to participants and the community.
- Develop ways of linking employers (including those in the volunteer sector) with program deliverers - to address key issues of program relevance, addressing skill shortages, workplace training, and making work opportunities accessible.



- Reward exemplary collaborative approaches between education, career and employment services, and employers - they can be role models for others on how the strategy works and the difference it can make.
- Include the following specific design features:
  - ▶ Develop comprehensive and tailored program design for those who need it.
  - ▶ For persons with disabilities, in the short-term provide specific targeted interventions, but as a transition approach to a longer-term strategy.
  - ▶ For post-secondary students and graduates - continue the policy developments on financing, debt reduction, and generation of links with employment following education. Adjust policies based on what is learned in implementation, with particular attention to the impacts on those in low socio-economic status groups. Examine the experience of other countries.
  - ▶ Continue efforts to improve post-secondary program quality, retention and completion, and affordability.
  - ▶ Provide supports for those who need them to participate in transition programs and take work.

### **Doing What Works in the Longer-Term**

The following longer-term strategic actions were suggested:

- Integrate career education and labour market information at all transition points in school and the labour market. Build on current innovative programs and develop new ways of providing access to this resource - technology, teaching methods, sharing information among organizations.
- Continue efforts to improve school achievement and completion.
- Develop, with the federal government and other provinces, a model for financing of post-secondary education that is based on the societal values for equitable access to quality education, and which will create a system that prevents the unprecedented debt problems faced by today's generation of students and graduates.
- For persons with disabilities, ensure access to generic programs by providing program deliverers of these programs with the supports and resources to meet the needs of persons with disabilities.
- Strengthen employment standards.
- Implement employment equity and barriers removal legislation - with teeth.

- Improve linkages of education and training with the needs of employers generally, and with jobs more specifically.
- Reward champions and achievers - demonstrate to consumers, service deliverers, and partners government's long-term commitment to the Strategy. Support and nourish their expertise as contributors to the Strategy.



## 1.0 Introduction

This report sets out the findings from a review of existing research and program evaluations on barriers to participation in the labour market and what works in addressing these barriers.

This is a background report, intended to inform the design of a labour market development strategy for the Province of Newfoundland and Labrador. This strategy will provide an action plan to help a wide range of government and community-based organizations better understand the dynamics of the provincial labour market and use this knowledge in shaping their policies and programs. The strategy will also help stakeholders focus on what works and maximize the return on investments in various initiatives. This is intended to be a strategy for all participants in the labour market.

A key component of the strategy is tackling the diverse barriers to employment that lead to inequities in labour market participation and create challenges for the development and viability of the demand side of the labour market, and doing this in an inclusive way.

The report is organized as follows:

- Section 2 reviews the research approach;
- Section 3 discusses labour market barriers in general and the concept of an inclusive response to barriers;
- Section 4 provides a detailed profile of each of the groups;
- Section 5 discusses specific labour market barriers, and how they affect the groups for which each is an issue;
- Section 6 presents the lessons learned on what works in addressing labour market barriers; and
- Section 7 presents proposed options for use of these lessons in the labour market development strategy.

Readers should note that the document draws on a wide range of evaluation and research studies from the provincial and national levels (with some of the national studies drawing on international research). These studies involve reviews of issues and programs in different settings and they use different methodologies. Many of the documents reviewed were syntheses of other studies, and general findings were presented, rather than critiques of individual programs. As well, some conclusions in the research reviewed are subjective and based on soft, qualitative data. This context has influenced the degree of specificity in the discussion of “what works.”

Care should be used in comparing results and in transferring the lessons learned from national studies directly to the Newfoundland and Labrador labour market, although we have included examples of programs that have been found to work in Newfoundland and Labrador where these were available to illustrate findings.

## 2.0 Research Approach

### 2.1 Groups Facing Barriers

The groups included in the study were developed in collaboration with Human Resources and Employment (HRE), with the intent of being inclusive of all the groups facing labour market barriers in the Province. They include:

- youth at risk;
- youth making the transition from school to further education or the labour market;
- post-secondary students and graduates;
- women;
- persons with disabilities;
- Aboriginal people;
- persons in receipt of income support<sup>2</sup>;
- single parents (includes males and females, but the majority are female) with low income and/or in receipt of income support;
- immigrants;
- older workers; and
- workers in rural areas.

Finally, we reviewed literature on the labour market barriers faced by employers. While in some cases the barriers they face fall into the same categories as those faced by workers (e.g., access to transportation for marketing, access to training), we have reported on the barriers and what works for employers separately from the discussion of workers.

### 2.2 Scope of Literature Review

The study focused on a review of existing Canadian and provincial literature on the above groups, the labour market barriers they face, and the interventions used to address these barriers. The literature included:

---

<sup>2</sup> In some literature reviewed, this group was known as persons in receipt of social assistance.

- The Lessons Learned Series of Human Resources Development Canada (HRDC). This is a series of synthesis reports that draws on Canadian and international studies on programming for specific groups in the labour market. The report has included many of the findings in this research.
- Reports from various sources that were provided by partner departments to the provincial labour market development strategy.
- Program evaluations of relevant national and provincial labour market programs, including mainstream programs as well as those targeted to specific groups.
- Statistical and policy research on specific groups conducted by provincial and national organizations and independent researchers.

The document review was intended to be a focused, rather than an exhaustive, synthesis of the existing literature on the groups facing barriers. It concentrated on documents that provided information relevant to the Province's labour market, and ones which included evaluative evidence on the programs reviewed. Annex A is the bibliography of documents reviewed.

Demographic and labour market data were gathered from the resources and reports reviewed and were supplemented by data provided by the Newfoundland and Labrador Statistics Agency (NLSA) to develop the labour market profile for each group facing barriers.

The review was structured to obtain the following information (where available) from each piece of research reviewed:

- data on the group(s) included;
- descriptions of barriers and their causes;
- lessons learned on policies and interventions that were considered to work in addressing barriers, and the reasons why;
- any evidence of interventions that have been shown not to work, and why; and
- any barriers or policy responses that still need further research.

A separate technical report contains the details of this research (Doing What Works - A Review of Research on Barriers to Participation in the Labour Market: Background Report for the Labour Market Development Strategy, Technical Report, 2003.)

## 2.3 Validation of Findings

The findings for each group were documented and shared with validators selected from among the stakeholder groups facing barriers. The validation process was intended to ensure the key barriers and lessons learned were covered, and that any additional existing research or gaps in the research were identified. The interviews were conducted one on one. We discussed the draft findings with 20 stakeholder groups in total, with specific groups being validated by one to three reviewers. (See Annex B for a list of the groups that assisted with the validation.)

## 2.4 Presentation Approach

The existing research is largely structured around groups, e.g., *Lessons Learned on the Effectiveness of Employment Programs for Youth*. However, in this report we present the findings by labour market barrier, and how each barrier is experienced by the group it affects, where relevant information on specific groups was available. In terms of what works for whom, we present the findings by broad and specific type of intervention, rather than interventions for specific groups.

We adopted this approach for two reasons:

- It became evident in reviewing the literature that many of the barriers are experienced by a number of the groups in differing ways.
- Similarly, there are a number of shared features in the interventions that have been found to work well in addressing the needs of a number (if not all) of disadvantaged groups.

This presentation structure is intended to make for a readable report. More important, it is intended that this approach will assist in developing an inclusive and integrated approach to the design of the provincial labour market development strategy - with a focus on the barriers as opposed to the groups.



## 3.0 Labour Market Barriers and Social Inclusion

In this section, we examine the nature of barriers to labour market participation and the concept and practice of a social inclusion approach to policy and program responses.

### 3.1 Labour Market Barriers Defined

In this report, labour market barriers are defined as anything that prevents or impedes individuals, and groups of individuals sharing common characteristics, from equal inclusion and opportunity in the labour market. Barriers faced by individuals also create obstacles to achieving an efficient and effective labour market, one where the dynamics of supply and demand work well.

Labour market barriers may be categorized in two ways to facilitate understanding their presentation and causes – environmental/external or personal/internal. In reality, individuals and groups may face combinations of barriers which in turn may lead to cumulative and multiple barriers that are more difficult to deal with. And there is interplay between personal and environmental barriers that add to the complexity of individual's needs (for example, a person with a criminal record has a personal barrier but also faces reluctance from employers).

*Environmental/external barriers* are those intentional or unintentional (systemic) conditions within the home, community, or labour market that have a negative impact on the person's ability to participate. Most barriers fall into this category. They may be:

- barriers to transition to the labour market, e.g., lack of access to programs and services;
- in the workplace, e.g., discrimination; lack of employment equity legislation;
- in the community, e.g., lack of accessible child care; or
- in the home, e.g. family influences on decisions.

*Personal/internal barriers* are the characteristics of individuals that impede their interaction with others and their capacity to participate in the labour market. Examples include a range of life skills, lack of mobility, and skills mismatch with opportunities.

### 3.2 Context for Barriers

The following context is also important to understanding the issue of labour market barriers and developing policy solutions.

- The barriers faced by individuals in the labour market (e.g., a wide range of needed supports) are often barriers they face in participating in the programs that are intended to help them make the transition to work.
- It has been shown that some barriers are faced by most disadvantaged individuals, for example, systemic program eligibility barriers or being uncompetitive in weak labour markets.
- Some barriers are more of an issue for specific groups, e.g., access to child care for some women and single parents.
- Some groups, and individuals within groups, face more complex and multiple barriers that require comprehensive programming tailored for the individual. Other groups reviewed, such as certain subgroups of women, employers, and those in rural areas face more specific barriers that require relevant, but not necessarily individually tailored, interventions.
- The groups facing barriers are not mutually exclusive, and many individuals belong to several groups and experience the predominant barriers faced by those individual groups, for example, women with disabilities and youth on income support. People who experience such multiple barriers may be excluded from appropriate services if service providers focus on the group they perceive the person belonging to, rather than the individual's needs. An actual example of this "labelling" that we encountered in a recent program evaluation was a single parent who used a wheelchair who was only referred to programs for persons with disabilities, and never to the Single Parent Employment Program.
- Most important, groups are not homogeneous, and individuals who are considered to belong to a specific labour market group may or may not experience barriers to the same extent as others. This was a common finding in the research on needs and program design for the groups reviewed. Inclusive programming takes a client-centred approach, which starts with the individual, informed by what is known about the group to which individuals are seen to belong. We discuss this concept and practice in the next section.

### **3.3 A Social Inclusion Approach to Programming**

This study examines the issues of barriers to labour market participation and how to prevent and remove them, from a social inclusion perspective.



## What is Social Inclusion<sup>3</sup>

Interestingly, inclusion is often described as exclusion. Consider the following definitions of social exclusion:

- “Those who are excluded whether because of poverty, ill health, gender, race or lack of education do not have the opportunity for full participation in the economic and social benefits of society” (Guilford, 2001).
- “Social and economic exclusion happens when people don’t have - and can’t get - the education, jobs, decent housing, health care, and other things they need to live comfortably, to participate in society, and to feel they are valued and respected members of their community (Atlantic Centre of Excellence for Women’s Health, 2001).

In comparison, social inclusion has been defined as follows:

- “To be included is to be accepted and to be able to participate fully within our families, our communities and our society” (Guilford, 2001).
- “Social inclusion is the capacity and willingness of our society to keep all groups within reach of what we expect as a society - the social commitments and investments necessary to ensure that socially and economically vulnerable people are within reach of our common aspirations, common life and its common wealth” (Laidlaw Foundation, 2001).

## Values

The foundation of social inclusion is found in commonly accepted values:

- social justice;
- valuing diversity;
- opportunities for choice;

---

<sup>3</sup>This discussion of social inclusion is based on the following sources:

Murphy, Helen and Wayne McGill, (Presentation) PPHB Atlantic, Population and Public Health Branch, Health Canada, 2003 (Includes quotes from Janet Guilford, Making the Case for Social and Economic Inclusion; Atlantic Centre of Excellence for Women’s Health, Social Exclusion Information Kit; Laidlaw Foundation, Toronto, 2001).

The National Strategy to Combat Poverty and Social Exclusion: an unprecedented effort to improve the lot of our poorest citizens, (announcement), Ministère de l’Emploi et de la Solidarité, Government of Quebec, 2002.

Social Exclusion Unit, Office of the Deputy Prime Minister, Government of the United Kingdom, 2001.

- entitlement to rights and to services; and
- working together.

### Social Inclusion Observed

The following table describes incidences of inclusion and exclusion when viewed through an inclusion lens.

| Dimension     | Inclusion Examples                    | Exclusion Examples                      |
|---------------|---------------------------------------|---|
| Cultural      | Valuing contributions/diversity       | Disadvantaged by cultural differences   |
| Economic      | Adequate income                       | Poverty/under-education                 |
| Functional    | Ability to participate                | Unable to participate due to disability |
| Participatory | Empowerment/freedom to choose         | Marginalization                         |
| Physical      | Access                                | Barriers to access                      |
| Political     | Affirmation of human rights/ fairness | Denial of rights/lack of trust          |
| Relational    | Belonging                             | Isolation                               |
| Structural    | Entitlement                           | Discrimination                          |

### Making Inclusion Happen in the Labour Market

There is a systematic approach to developing inclusive policies and programs.

#### Step 1 – Knowing When Inclusion is Happening

If we want to know who is being excluded from an economic and labour market perspective, we first need to determine how we would see inclusion working. More specifically, inclusion would mean having equal opportunities with the rest of the population to realize one's ambitions and potential in the labour market. This would be achieved through acquiring the appropriate education for one's goals, having access to the employment opportunities one aspires to or needs, working in a supportive work environment, having access to supports and services to obtain and maintain work, and being paid equitable earnings for work performed.

#### Step 2 – Deciding Who to Focus On

Because there are many ways people can be excluded, there is a range of population groups that are excluded for one or more reasons. Labour market policies and programs designed and delivered through an inclusive approach can prevent or help reduce the barriers faced by various groups. Inclusion welcomes individuals and groups that society has previously left out into planning, decision-making, and policy development processes in their community. They become empowered

or included by offering them the opportunities, resources, and support they need to participate.

| Population Groups Often Excluded |                           |
|----------------------------------|---------------------------|
| Single mothers and children      | Women                     |
| Aboriginal peoples               | Immigrants                |
| Gays and lesbians                | Persons with disabilities |
| Youth at risk                    | Unemployed                |

### **Step 3 – Defining the Barriers**

Further identifying the specific barriers that are faced by particularly vulnerable population groups as they seek to enter and advance in the labour market is the next step.

### **Step 4 – Identifying Root Causes**

Determining the various aspects of exclusion also requires an identification of those groups or systems that are causing the exclusion of others.

### **Step 5 – Choosing Policy Solutions**

Solutions are achieved through several actions, carried out concurrently:

- public policies that support inclusion;
- programs and services that reduce barriers through mitigative approaches (for example financial incentives or penalties for those who are creating the exclusion); and
- developmental approaches, for example education and skills development for those who experience the barriers, or sensitization training for those who are creating the exclusion.

### **Some Recent Policy Developments**

Some jurisdictions have recently begun to address issues of social exclusion and have put strategies in place to enhance inclusion.

Recently, the Province of Quebec announced a strategy to combat poverty and social exclusion which they call “an unprecedented effort to improve the lot of our poorest citizens.” The strategy has three goals:

- to improve the economic and social situation of people living in poverty who are marginalized by society;

- to reduce inequalities of people living in poverty; and
- to take comprehensive approaches in developing a sense of solidarity.

The Ministère de l'Emploi et de la Solidarité has a dual mission of fighting social exclusion and unemployment. Its employment component promotes employment and development of the available workforce through improvements to the labour market. It ensures a better balance between workforce supply and demand in this market by contributing to the reduction of unemployment and social and occupational exclusion. The Ministry's social solidarity component includes the provision of financial assistance to households that lack the resources to meet their needs; helps people resolve their various social problems that hinder their social and economic integration, and financially supports community groups in their work among the population.

In 1997, the British Government established a Social Exclusion Unit. The definition used by Britain is "Social exclusion is a shorthand term for what can happen when people or areas suffer from a combination of linked problems such as unemployment, poor skills, low incomes, poor housing, high crime environments, bad health, and family breakdown" (Government of the United Kingdom). The UK government has adopted a strategic approach to tackling social exclusion including solutions relating to prevention for various population groups, accessibility for all to mainstream services, and reintegrating people who have "fallen through the net."

### **This Study**

The lessons learned from the literature reviewed for this study reinforce the value-added of an inclusive approach to labour market policy development, and the shortfalls in policies and programs when they are not developed from this perspective.

## 4.0 Profile of Groups Facing Labour Market Barriers

In this section, we present a profile of each of the groups reviewed in this research. Where available, these provide key labour market indicators, the extent to which groups participate in the labour market in comparison to the overall labour force, and other relevant comparison groups, as well as indicators of the most important barriers they face.

### 4.1 Youth at Risk

This is defined as the group, generally aged 15 to 24, who have not completed high school and who face multiple barriers to employment. Data indicate that this group is diminishing in size, but is still facing problems in the labour market.

The high school dropout rate has decreased significantly in the Province over the past decade. Young men are still less likely to graduate. According to the 2001 census, 33,185 youth under age 24 had less than high school completion, with the majority (55%) being male. Among 20 year olds surveyed in 1999, the proportion of those who had not completed high school and were not working towards its completion fell to 15% for young men, from 29% in 1991. For young women, the proportion fell from 19% to 6%. Young men are now at the Canadian average for non-completion of high school, and young women are some 3% better than the Canadian average (Youth in Transition Longitudinal Survey, HRDC, Statistics Canada, 2000).

Youth aged 15 to 24 with less than high school completion are at a disadvantage in finding good paying and stable work. Their average employment income (full-time, full-year activity) for the year 2000 was \$16,644 compared to \$37,806 for all ages and all levels of schooling (Statistics Canada, 2001 Census).

The number of youth on social assistance has greatly declined - by 44% between 1991 and 2002. This change is attributed to a combination of demographics (the youth population declined by 30% in this period), more opportunities for work, and changes in government policy (From the Ground Up, Community Accounts).

### 4.2 Youth Making the Transition from School to Further Education or the Labour Market

More young people in the Province are going directly to post-secondary education from high school. 71% of high school graduates surveyed in 2000-01 had gone on to post-secondary education (compared to 65% in 1995), and 93% of those not in post-secondary school expressed a desire to attend in future (Beyond High School, Follow-Up Survey of June 2001 High School Graduates, Department of Youth Services and Post-Secondary Education).

Youth have a lower participation rate in the labour force than adult workers, influenced by the decision of many to continue on with post-secondary education. According to the 2001 Census, those aged 15 to 24 had a participation rate of 48.7% compared to 57.6% for the population as a whole. Their unemployment rate is persistently higher than that of adult workers (33% compared to 22% in 2001). The majority of those not in post-secondary education work in low-skill, low-wage sales and service occupations (Statistics Canada).

### **4.3 Post-Secondary Students and Graduates**

Post-secondary enrolment is rising significantly. Enrolment in the Province in full-time studies increased by 100% over the past decade, while part-time studies enrolment increased by 160%. However, accessibility is an issue: national data indicate that a significant gap in participation in university education is evident between lower, middle, and higher income Canadians. No such difference is observed for community colleges (cost and geographic dispersion are seen as factors). Aboriginal people and persons with disabilities are less likely to obtain a post-secondary education (Price of Knowledge: Access and Student Finance in Canada, Canada Millennium Scholarships Foundation, 2002).

This significant growth in post-secondary participation has come with a price. The per capita number of Canada Student Loans in the Province is twice the Canadian average. The number of borrowers and total value of loans is increasing at a greater rate than the Canadian average. In 2000-01, the average total accumulated debt for university student borrowers in their final year of undergraduate studies was \$30,259. Fifty-four percent of full-time university students in the Province borrowed student loans (YSPSE data). Access to post-secondary education for rural residents and those in disadvantaged groups is a policy concern (Investing in Learning - Investing in People, Skills and Learning for Social and Economic Development in Newfoundland and Labrador, Government of Newfoundland and Labrador, 2002).

Graduation rates vary by institution and program. The Memorial University rate is improving (80% for five-year programs and 65% for four-year programs in 1998-99), but remains below the national average and below the level achieved by many other universities. Public college graduation rates are around 60% for one and two year programs; however, the rate for three year programs is persistently low - 33% of those entering in 1996 completed by 1999 (YSPSE data).

Graduates perform at or above the national average on a number of national certificate exams, including the Red Seal Examinations for the trades (YSPSE data).

Eighty-six percent of post-secondary graduates in the Province from 1995 who were surveyed in 2001 were employed, the majority in full-time jobs directly or indirectly related to their education. Graduates of longer programs had better employment rates. Males were generally earning more than females, and those



graduates living outside the Province also earned higher wages. Most graduates were satisfied with their work and wages (Fast Forward, Department of Youth Services and Post-Secondary Education, 2003). In a national study, it was found that university graduates from the Atlantic provinces earn less than those from other regions, while Atlantic college graduates earn as much as those in Ontario and Western Canada (The School to Work Transition of Post-secondary Graduates in Canada: Research based on the National Graduates Survey, HRDC, 2001).

#### **4.4 Women**

There has been a dramatic increase in the participation of women in the paid workforce over the past thirty years, while the participation rate of men has decreased. Several factors account for this rapid expansion - changing demographics, family structures (higher divorce rate and less children per family), women's rising education levels, changes in social attitudes, and growing demand for women's labour in the expanding service sector (Gender Equality in the Labour Market Lessons Learned, HRDC, 2002).

According to Statistics Canada, 52% of women of working age in the Province participated in the labour market compared to 63% of men. However, within the youth category the participation rates were very similar (49% for males and 48% for females). Women worked slightly more weeks than men (36.9 weeks for women compared to 35.8 weeks for men).

In 2002, unemployment rates for women were lower than men aged 15 years and over (19% compared to 24%). Young women were considerably more likely than other women to be unemployed, but they were less likely than their male counterparts to be unemployed (Statistics Canada).

On a national basis, female lone parents are less likely to be employed than other females and males. And women in the Atlantic provinces and Quebec have higher unemployment levels than in other regions (Statistics Canada).

Regardless of education, women are still less likely than men to be employed, although the gaps are smallest among better-educated women. Aboriginal women are less likely than non-Aboriginal women to be part of the paid workforce, and they are heavily concentrated in low-paying jobs.

Nationally, women are more likely than men to be in non-standard jobs (part-time and contingent work), and the percentage of women in these jobs has been increasing. An increasing number of workers hold more than one job, and they are disproportionately women (Gender Equality in the Labour Market, Lessons Learned, HRDC, 2002).

Women in the Province make up 36% of all self-employed workers. About the same proportion of women as men entrepreneurs are self-employed without paid help, which are termed own-account workers (57% and 59% respectively). This

is less than the national proportion of women entrepreneurs (67%) without paid help (Statistics Canada). Self-employed women are more likely to work part-time than men and the wage gap between women and men in self-employment is larger than that among paid workers (Gender Equality in the Labour Market, Lessons Learned, HRDC, 2002).

Women are still concentrated in traditional female occupations, most of which are lower paid. In 2001 in Newfoundland and Labrador, over 70% were working in one of teaching, health, clerical, or sales/service occupations (Statistics Canada). Women dominate in child care and home care occupations, which are undervalued in terms of wages paid (Gender Equality in the Labour Market, Lessons Learned, HRDC, 2002).

Nationally, the proportion in these occupations has slowly declined over the past decade, mostly due to a decline in the share of clerical work. Representation in several professional fields has increased in recent years, but women are very much a minority in professions in the natural sciences, engineering, and mathematics. Women have increased their share of total employment in managerial positions, although they are better represented in lower-level management positions (Gender Equality in the Labour Market, Lessons Learned, HRDC, 2002).

In the Province, 7% of women in the labour force are in manufacturing (due primarily to employment in fish processing) compared to 10% of men. Very few women work in construction, mining, or oil and gas (Statistics Canada).

In the year 2000 in Newfoundland and Labrador, the average earnings of all female earners was 65% of average male earnings, or \$17,656 compared to \$27,136 (Statistics Canada). Canada and the United States have the largest gender pay gaps among industrialized nations. In Canada, the earnings gap is more narrow: in 2000, among full-time full-year workers, women earned 72% of the average earnings of men (67% in Newfoundland and Labrador), compared to 59% in 1976, a result of stagnant earnings for men and rising earnings for women. For workers in non-standard jobs, the gap has narrowed further. Among part-time workers, women earn more than men, except those with university degrees. This is because women who work part-time tend to be older, better educated, with more work experience, whereas men are more likely to work part-time in their youth. The wage gap narrows for younger workers (Gender Equality in the Labour Market, Lessons Learned, HRDC, 2002).

Measuring comparative median, after tax income data,<sup>4</sup> women in Canada had annual incomes (all income including transfer payments, and all women including seniors) that were 61% of men's (\$13,806 versus \$22,673 in 1998). The gap is wider in the Atlantic provinces, where women's incomes are 59% of men's.

<sup>4</sup> Survey of Labour and Income Dynamics, Statistics Canada.



The majority of the poor in Canada are women, and one in five Canadian women live in what Statistics Canada defines as a low income situation. Women in all the disadvantaged groups are more likely to be poor, particularly racialized groups, Aboriginal women, single lone parents, or women with disabilities (Statistics Canada).

#### **4.5 Persons with Disabilities**

The World Health Organization (WHO) definition of disability, originally proposed in 1980, now represents the version most accepted worldwide. This recognizes disability as involving an interaction between the individual and the environment. In other words, disability is not a characteristic of the person but rather a relationship between the person and the environment. This view clearly shifts the focus from changing or “fixing” the person to that of increased consideration of environmental accommodation. This has significant implications for how one deals with, and understands, the area of labour market participation for persons with disabilities.

In discussing barriers faced by the “disabled” or a labour market strategy for the “disabled” it is paramount that one recognizes that persons with disabilities do not represent a uniform or homogenous group. Persons with disabilities in Canada present as a very diverse group. Indeed many researchers have suggested that persons with disabilities have more in common with the general population than with each other.

In 2001, the number of adult persons in the Province with disabilities was 57,690 with slightly more than half (52%) being female. This represents approximately 11% of the general population. In addition to the adult population, there are 2,800 children under the age of 15 who have disabilities (Participation and Activity Limitation Survey, Statistics Canada 2001). National data on persons with disabilities (Survey of Labour and Income Dynamics - SLID) paint a picture of the extent of barriers they face to labour market participation.

Persons with disabilities have a labour force participation rate that is half the rate of persons without disabilities, and they are nearly twice as likely to be unemployed compared to persons without disabilities. Participation rates of men and women differ significantly - women with disabilities are less likely to be employed than men. Persons with disabilities tend to have lower levels of education. When employed, they are much more likely to incur job separation or be working part-time, tend to work in lesser skilled occupations, and earn significantly lower wages (Statistics Canada).

The majority of the group have mild disabilities. Persons with severe disabilities are least likely to be in the labour force (although 26% of persons with severe disabilities do participate).

The unemployment rate of persons with serious mental illness has been commonly reported to range from 70-90% depending on the severity of the disability.

Demographic changes are expected to result in increasing numbers of people with disabilities in Canada, particularly among the working aged population.

#### **4.6 Aboriginal People**

In 2001, 3.7% of the provincial population was of Aboriginal identity. They are a young and rapidly expanding segment of Canada's population. The Aboriginal population continues to be at risk and disadvantaged, evidenced by high rates of poverty, welfare dependency, and unemployment.

Many are poorly equipped with the education to participate in the labour force. Aboriginal people are twice as likely to have less than high school education, and are five times less likely to have a university degree compared to the general population. Poor outcomes at the secondary level are often a barrier to accessing and completing higher education (What Work for Whom?, HRDC 1999).

National labour force participation rates for Aboriginal persons 15 to 64 are just over 50% compared to approximately 70% for non-Aboriginal persons, even among those with higher education credentials (Statistics Canada).

Average personal and family incomes of Aboriginal persons are just over 50% of the incomes of non-Aboriginal persons (Statistics Canada).

#### **4.7 Persons in Receipt of Income Support**

Adults moving from welfare to work have at least one thing in common - they are considered to be potentially employable but, for the time being, and perhaps for much longer, they are unemployed, poor and dependent on social assistance. These three conditions may be causally inter-related and, for this client group, close off many life choices that others of independent means take for granted (What Works for Whom? HRDC, 1999).

15.6% of the provincial population received social assistance in 2001, a decrease from 17.1% in 1991 and 20.5% in 1996. Of the total persons in receipt of social assistance in March 2003, 41% were employable adults. Of the employable group, 67% had less than high school education, a proportion that has been slowly declining over the past decade (Human Resources and Employment data).

The number of youth aged 18-29 on social assistance has greatly declined - by 44% between 1991 and 2002. Demographic changes (the youth population declined by 31% in this period), labour market conditions, and policy changes are seen as factors in this decrease. The decline in the number of new cases aged 18-29 has been most striking, some 65% between 1991 and 2002 (Human Resources and Employment data).

Persons in receipt of income support face difficulties in finding stable employment that pays enough to meet the needs of their family, to become self-reliant, and to reduce poverty.

#### **4.8 Single Parents**

In 1961 single mother-led families made up 8% of all Canadian families; by 2001 that figure had increased to 20%. In 2001, 23,050 or 23% of families with children in this province were lone-parent families, 82% of which were headed by female single parents (Statistics Canada, 2001 Census).

Female single parents are less likely than mothers in two-parent families to be employed. However, the proportion of employed single mothers has increased substantially in Canada in recent years. The presence of young children also has a greater impact on the employment of single mothers than it does their counterparts with partners.

Female single parents and their children are one of the most vulnerable sectors of our society and are over-represented in the ranks of the poor. The poverty rate for Canadian female single parents was 57.3% in 1994 (Statistics Canada).

While nearly 75% of female single parents families had some earnings from employment, 52% of these families had incomes below the Low Income Cut-offs (Statistics Canada).

Single parents, as with other persons in receipt of social assistance, face the challenge of finding work that will pay enough to provide for the family as well as the cost of taking work.

#### **4.9 Immigrants**

Immigrants represent 16% of Canada's population. The 2001 Census reported an immigrant population of 8,030 in Newfoundland and Labrador, making up 1.6% of the population and 1.9% of the labour force. About one-half of immigrants to the Province report their birthplace as Europe (primarily the United Kingdom) with Asia and the United States being the other primary birthplaces.

Between 1991 and 1996, persons born outside of Canada accounted for fully 71% of net growth in Canada's labour force. As Canada's population ages, immigrants are expected to account for all net labour force growth in Canada by 2001, and for all net population growth by 2031.

Recent immigrants have higher average education levels than the Canadian-born population. However, the labour market outcomes of immigrants are poor and worsening. It takes up to 10 years for the earnings of university-educated immigrants to catch up with those of their Canadian counterparts, and employment

rates are widening. This trend has contributed to rising poverty levels among recent immigrants (Knowledge Matters, HRDC, 2002).

The participation rate of the provincial immigrant population was reported as 60.5% in the 2001 labour force census. In Newfoundland and Labrador, male immigrants who arrived within the last five years have a slightly better participation rate in the labour market than males in the general labour force, which differs from the national picture. However, female immigrants had a lower participation rate than females in general and than female immigrants nationally.

Of the more than 58,000 skilled workers (principal applicants) across the country, Newfoundland's share was 55 for the year 2000. An average of 47% of government assisted refugees left Newfoundland within seven months of their residency in recent years (Association for New Canadians, report validation process).

#### **4.10 Older Workers**

The proportion of the provincial population aged 45 to 64 was 26.5% in 2001, compared to 15% in 1981. Similar trends are being seen in Canada and many industrialized countries. At the same time, there has been large scale economic restructuring and industrial restructuring which have generated a number of labour market problems for the general workforce and older workers in particular.

The workforce is also aging, with older male workers participating in the labour force at a higher rate than the workforce in general. This rate of participation has been steadily increasing over the past two decades. This age group makes up 34% of the labour force in the 2001 census profile (Statistics Canada).

#### **4.11 Workers in Rural Areas**

More than half of this province's population (52.6%) live in urban areas. Many of these are concentrated in the St. John's Census Metropolitan Area where one of every three individuals in the Province now reside (Statistics Canada, 2001 Census).

Between 1991 and 2002, the Province's population dropped by 9%, with the drop being greater in rural areas. The working aged population in rural areas has decreased to a greater extent than in urban areas. And the participation rate in rural areas varies on a seasonal basis more so than in urban areas (Newfoundland and Labrador Statistics Agency).

There has been a considerable decline in rural youth populations across Canada. The net loss in Newfoundland and Labrador was between 21 to 25 % of 15 to 19 year-olds during 1986-91. It is estimated that only one in four rural youth in Canada who leave will return to the same community within 10 years (Malatest for Canadian Rural Partnership, 2002).

More people work in the private sector than in the public sector in all regions of the Province. However, the public sector is important in the overall job picture (Newfoundland and Labrador Statistics Agency).

#### **4.12 Employers**

There were 17,257 registered businesses in the Province in 2002. By far, the majority of these were small businesses with 98% of these employing less than 100 employees. Businesses with one to four employees make up the largest proportion, with 60% of all businesses in the Province in this range (Statistics Canada Business Register, 2002).

The number of registered businesses in the Province has been stable over the 1999 to 2001 period. Only the Avalon Strategic Social Plan region registered an increase. Most jobs are concentrated in a small number of sectors, the top four being retail trade, health care and social assistance, construction and other services except public administration. Retail and wholesale sales and exports have all grown over the past decade, with retail sales being second only to Alberta (Newfoundland and Labrador Statistics Agency).

Since 1998, employment growth has averaged 2.9% annually, second highest among all provinces and ahead of the national growth rate of 2.2%. About 52% of the people in the labour force worked all year in 2001, and 43% worked part of the year. In 2001, 89.2% of the employment in the Province (for 25 to 64 year-olds) was full time, compared to 87% for Canada (Statistics Canada).

In a 2001 provincial survey, 48% of workers considered themselves to be seasonal workers. Eighty-four percent of workers said they were satisfied with their work, with slightly more men than women being satisfied. Only 4% said they were dissatisfied because they did not get enough hours. Forty-eight percent of workers had received formal job training paid for by their employer during their working lifetime, and most felt this would be helpful for other work (Newfoundland and Labrador Labour Activity Survey, Newfoundland and Labrador Statistics Agency, 2001).





## 5.0 Labour Market Barriers

In this section, we set out what was learned from the literature on the barriers faced by the groups reviewed. The information is presented as follows:

Barriers have been grouped into two broad categories: environmental/external and personal/internal, with sub-groupings in each of these. More specific barriers within the sub-groupings are then described, including information on which groups the barriers affect (where this information was available in previous research). There is one important caveat for readers to bear in mind. We have attempted to be inclusive of the important barriers for each group, however, some groups had more coverage in the literature, and, as a consequence, more information may be provided on those groups.

Annex C contains charts that summarize the barriers as they are experienced by each group.

### 5.1 Environmental/External Barriers

This category of barriers is the most prevalent across groups. These are the barriers that present the most challenges for individuals, since they often have little or no control over them. Government policies and programs play a key role in preventing or eliminating environmental/external barriers.

For persons with disabilities, a cross cutting systemic barrier that impacts on many of them is the lack of barrier removal legislation with strong enforcement provisions.<sup>5</sup>

#### Barriers to Transition to the Labour Market

##### *Lack of or Limited Work Opportunities*

Unemployment for disadvantaged groups, like unemployment generally, is affected by the overall level of economic activity in the Province - this is evidenced by the persistent higher unemployment rate in the Province compared to other areas of Canada (Statistics Canada). However, even when the economy is improving as it is now in the Province, groups facing barriers often lack a clear path (skills and contacts) to link with growth occupations and sectors. Access to stable work that matches the personal and financial aspirations of individuals is a key driver of an inclusive labour market, yet is beyond the reach of many groups. This is evidenced in the statistics on labour market participation, employment, and wage rates for the more disadvantaged groups (see profiles in section 4.0).

<sup>5</sup> The American with Disabilities Act, which sets out clear standards for what has to be done, has been contrasted with the limited effectiveness of human rights commissions in Canada (HRDC, Disability Policies and Programs: Lessons Learned, 1977).

It is worth noting an observation made by some provincial officials when we were validating this report. Their perspective is that many clients do not view employment programs as helping. Rather, they want direct access to work, and perceive a stigma attached to being a program participant. In our view, this reinforces the fact that access to jobs is a primary barrier remover.

There is a sharp divide in the labour force participation of low-skilled and high-skilled Canadians (Knowledge Matters, HRDC, 2002).

Global economic restructuring has implications for the types and quality of jobs available. There has been an expansion of contingent or non-standard work (e.g., part-time, contract) as a result of the pressures on firms to be flexible to survive in a competitive environment. This type of work often pays low wages and provides no benefits (Townson, 2003).

The types of businesses in our province also limit opportunities for groups like persons with disabilities. Most businesses in Newfoundland and Labrador have less than four staff (Statistics Canada Business Register). Small business owners require staff who are flexible and able to multi-task (e.g., maintenance people). Often these kinds of work are not suited to persons with disabilities.

The volunteer sector is often not recognized as a legitimate sector offering both paid and volunteer work opportunities. For many persons facing barriers, this sector offers supportive work environments, both as a destination and as a place to develop transferable skills for other sectors. The Federal Voluntary Sector Initiative, announced in 2000, is a response to the rapidly changing environment of the sector, one where organizations are asked to deliver more services. The VPI has among its priorities increased public awareness of the sector among government and the public, and capacity building (Government of Canada, VPI website).

Women - The expansion of non-standard work (part-time, contract, temporary help, own account self-employment (no employees), makes it impossible for many women to find sustainable employment. This has both short and long-term impacts for their economic security, as it affects eligibility for regular and special Employment Insurance benefits (and consequently access to programs via EI), public and private pensions, and non-wage benefits. Women remain over-represented in jobs and sectors that offer less pay. In weak labour markets, self-employment is an alternative. However, women face a number of gender-based challenges in starting and growing businesses that require assistance tailored to their needs (Townson, 2003).

Aboriginal people - Aboriginal people have not fared well in the economic mainstream for a variety of reasons, including a weak economic base in their communities, and discrimination in larger society. Communities where they live are often rural, and lacking in the physical infrastructure needed for development. These constrain the communities' capacity to create jobs and to become reasonably self-sustaining. Aboriginal populations may exist close to developing areas, but



the opportunities may be unsuited to the culture, aspirations, and abilities of Aboriginal people (What Works for Whom?, HRDC, 1999).

Persons in receipt of income support - This group is vulnerable to changing economic and labour market conditions, and faces an inability to find paid, stable work paying sufficient wages to reduce their poverty level and meet their family and personal needs. There are financial disincentives to taking low paying and part-time work - income support is often required to top up their earnings to income support levels (Phase 1 Research Component of the Self-Sufficiency Project, Newfoundland and Labrador, 2002, and Reconnecting Social Assistance Recipients to the Labour Market, HRDC, 2000).

Single parents - Single parents who are on income support or among the working poor face similar barriers to persons in receipt of income support in general - lack of access to good paying jobs that enable them to achieve self-sufficiency (Danziger, 1998, Gueron, 1990, Gallant and Associates, 2002).

Immigrants - Those who do not arrive with a job arranged, and who require assistance to enter the labour market, face minimal employment prospects in the Province. Immigrants have been found to experience greater education-occupation discrepancies compared to other groups. They also face discrimination and racism. The inability to find adequate employment is a predominant barrier to successful integration into Canadian society (Knowledge Matters, HRDC, 2002).

Post-secondary graduates - Workers with higher education face better prospects of employment and earnings in the labour market relative to other groups (Statistics Canada). Among those who complete university, there is a much smaller difference in unemployment rates between Newfoundland and Labrador and Canada as a whole (4.9% and 3.8% respectively (Statistics Canada). However, graduates who remain in the Province do not do as well as those who leave, in terms of their average wages and employment rates (Fast Forward, Youth Services and Post-Secondary Education). This becomes a particular issue for graduates with high debt loads. Overall, the evidence is that those with higher levels of education are less likely to be without a job and less likely to be negatively affected by weaker economies (Youth Services and Post-Secondary Education (YSPSE), report validation process).

Older workers - Older workers in the 55 to 64 age group have been found to be more seriously affected by economic downturns, closures and layoffs than others (What Works for Whom? HRDC, 1999). Displaced older workers in rural areas face more limited options for work.

Workers and businesses in rural areas - Rural areas offer fewer options for interesting and sustained employment than urban areas, a key factor in the out-migration of young people. The population decline we have experienced has, in turn, reduced the markets for existing businesses and placed constraints on the capacity of rural communities to attract investments and diversify their economies (Bristol Group, 2003).

### ***Lack of Access to Transition Programs and Services***

Disadvantaged groups face a number of barriers to accessing relevant programs and services to help them make the transition to and within the labour market. This is particularly an issue for those experiencing multiple or more severe barriers, where comprehensive and coordinated help with all their needs is important to their success. Those needing tailored and coordinated programs most include youth at risk, persons with severe disabilities, some single parents, and persons in receipt of income support.

The barriers to program access center on program design and supports, eligibility and financing, and delivery (Roeher 2002; Roeher 1996) It should be noted that these are barriers that many jurisdictions (including this province) have as central considerations in their labour market policies and programs, and there are ongoing efforts to design appropriate policy and program responses. There are also existing programs that do address at least some of these barriers. (Note that this research did not review all existing provincial programs.) Nevertheless, the literature indicates that these are important issues that require a continued and creative policy design effort.

#### PROGRAM DESIGN AND SUPPORTS

- Lack of programs that start with the needs of the individuals and tailor the design from there to accommodate all the objectives intended and the needs that participants present.
- Lack of access to comprehensive career information and counselling that covers all the options - in schools as well as in the labour market and communities. This is a barrier that crosses all groups. One outcome of this is lack of awareness among those in the labour market of the full range of career options, and the programs and assistance available.
- One growing concern is the perceived bias of the education system toward the university track; as a consequence the apprenticeship system is not turning out enough graduates for current and forecasted demand (Knowledge Matters, HRDC, 1999). In this province, there is also an imperative to ensure the apprentice system works for the Aboriginal population in Labrador, in order to maximize the benefits of the Voisey's Bay development. Aboriginal participation in apprenticeship was the subject of a national review that highlighted a number of current approaches in other provinces that are working (Canadian Labour Force Development Board, 1999).
- Training and education that is not well linked to the labour market and jobs - not keeping up with skill needs and outdated infrastructure and technology that does not match current industry practices.

- Lack of a range of collateral supports while in programming - disability, personal, cultural supports, affordable quality child care, and transportation costs.<sup>6</sup>
- Lack of sustained programming: This is an issue for participants who need a continuum of supports during transition and after starting work. It is also an impediment to programs making a difference with a critical mass of targeted participants, and to building the capacity internally for continual improvement.
- Lack of prior learning assessment processes: For individuals, non-recognition of skills lead to higher debt loads, duplication of learning, and is a major disincentive to lifelong learning (Investing in Learning - Investing in People, Youth Services and Post- Secondary Education, 2002).

#### ELIGIBILITY AND FINANCING

- Systemic financial disincentives to participation through loss of and clawback of some benefits.
- Program eligibility criteria that are based on categories or groups and not on the individual's needs and barriers, including eligibility tied to Employment Insurance (discussed below).
- Inconsistent definitions of barriers across organizations (e.g., definition of disability).
- Inequitable access to post-secondary education (as evidenced by participation rates) for those in low socio-economic status, particularly those from low-income families, Aboriginal people, persons with disabilities.
- The looming capacity crunch in educational institutions (infrastructure and anticipated rising number of retirements among teaching staff) may worsen accessibility prospects (Knowledge Matters, HRDC, 2002). In this province, the crunch is in specific high demand programs (some three-year public college programs, trades programs in some regions, some professional schools at Memorial University, but not in all programs, due to declining enrolment and an already adequate capacity (YSPSE, report validation process).

#### PROGRAM DELIVERY

- Lack of program coordination, which is particularly an issue for participants with multiple needs to be met by various agencies.

<sup>6</sup> This is an area where there have been some program responses in the Province - Single Parent Employment Program is one example.

- Attitudes of some service providers that discourage persons in receipt of income support interested in working (Reconnecting Social Assistance Recipients to the Labour Market, HRDC, 2000; Phase 1 Research Component of the Self-Sufficiency Project Newfoundland and Labrador, Goss Gilroy, 2002).

The following are two particular aspects of financing and accessing that were highlighted in the process of developing this report.

#### COST OF EDUCATION AND STUDENT DEBT

Student debt is a major public policy issue, and was identified widely in the literature and among those consulted in the report validation process. While the Province has seen significant growth in post-secondary participation, the growth has not come without a price. Students in this province have relied heavily on student loans.

Despite provincial policy initiatives which have reduced tuition fees over the past three years, and other related initiatives to assist with debt reduction and access to employment, student living costs continue to drive up the cost of post-secondary education and hamper accessibility, particularly for rural and disadvantaged youth (Investing in Learning - Investing in People, YSPSE, 2002).

To illustrate this issue, we have shown the average accumulated debt in the final year of studies in 2001-02. The percentage increase since 1996-97 is also shown (YSPSE data).

| Program Type                      | Accumulated Debt in Final Year of Studies | % Increase Since 1996/97 |
|-----------------------------------|---|--------------------------|
| Memorial University Undergraduate | \$31, 218                                 | 38%                      |
| Public College Three-Year Program | \$26,022                                  | 85%                      |
| Private College Two-Year Program  | \$22,324                                  | 24%                      |

Debt-income ratios are also rising significantly. For example, the average student debt for a female undergraduate in Canada in 1982 was equal to 17% of her first year earnings after graduation. This had risen to 51% by 1995. By comparison, a study in the United States found that the average debt to earnings ratio for people forced to declare bankruptcy was 71% (Finnie, Educational Quarterly Review).

#### IMPACT OF EI ON ACCESS TO PROGRAMS

This was an issue raised by a number of groups consulted in the validation process. EI eligibility (or reachback status for persons in receipt of income support from the Province) is required for access to most HRDC Employment Benefits and Support Measures. A number of people consulted in this review process raised the issue of EI eligibility as a barrier for access to programs for groups who find it difficult to establish a strong labour market attachment. While we found no extensive studies of this specific issue (the summative evaluation of the Newfoundland and Labrador EBSMs is now underway and may shed some light on this), the following

data from the HRDC Employment Insurance Monitoring and Assessment Reports may help to inform the discussion.

Following the EI Act changes in 1996 which were designed to encourage stronger attachment to the labour market, regular beneficiaries dropped by 18% in 1998 nationally (and by 10% in Newfoundland and Labrador); HRDC attributed half of this drop to the changes in rules. Nationally, two groups were more particularly affected - claims for women dropped by 20% and young people under age 25 filed 27% fewer claims (1998 Employment Insurance Monitoring and Assessment Report, HRDC).

Subsequent reports have tracked access to the EI program using various measures. The 2002 report estimated that 88% of individuals in paid employment would be eligible for benefits if they had lost their jobs, with the level of access being consistent across all regions. 84.3% of women would have had access, compared to 90.6% of men (the difference being attributed to the fact that more women work part-time). Accessibility for men (96%) and women (95%) who worked full-time was virtually the same. Eighty-three percent of the unemployed population were eligible for benefits. (There was no data provided on how access compared to pre-EI Act changes.)

The report indicated that women and youth were the key beneficiaries of the Small Weeks provision, which encourages workers to work weeks with lower earnings without impact on EI entitlement.

In terms of access to Employment Benefits and Support Measures, the 2002 report indicates that participation of persons with disabilities, Aboriginal people, and visible minorities in programs was stable (at 2.3%, 2.5%, and 2.8% respectively). The participation of women in programs had decreased by 2.6 percentage points from the previous year to 35.7% of program interventions. Women were more likely to participate in services rather than longer-term program interventions. This was deemed due to the fact that few women participate in apprenticeship programs (2002 Employment Insurance Monitoring and Assessment Report, HRDC). There were 2,281 SAR reachback participants in EBSM interventions in 2001-02, representing approximately 42% of the total income support recipients eligible for EBSMs (HRDC and HRE data).

### **Barriers in the Workplace**

Success in obtaining entry-level jobs and advancement in the workplace are both affected by barriers in the workplace. These include discrimination and attitudes, underemployment and non-standard jobs, lack of work supports, and wage disparities. In particular, these barriers affect women, persons with disabilities, Aboriginal people, and immigrants. The absence of barrier removal legislation with strong enforcement provisions contributes to these barriers, as it does to transition programs.



## **Discrimination**

This can affect access to opportunities long before entry to the labour market, starting with the kinds of career choices we steer young people to making, particularly, young females. Discrimination may be intentional, based on assumptions of what people are capable of doing, social stigmas against certain groups, or perceptions of the hardships they will create for the workplace (e.g., perception of challenges to their integration). However, systemic discrimination is seen as largely unintentional, and includes social pressures about career choices, organizational and workplace practices, and cultures that exclude certain groups from obtaining work and moving beyond entry-level positions (Gender Equality in the Labour Market Lessons Learned, HRDC, 2002).

In the labour market, people with disabilities must deal with societal attitudes (from many sources) that see them as unemployable - where the focus is on what they cannot do rather than on what they can do (Roehrer 2002; Lessons Learned, HRDC; HRDC; Roehrer 1996). Persons with mental disabilities face societal barriers, especially the attitudes of fellow employees. There is generally a lack of understanding of the nature of this disability. Mental health disability often gets overlooked in the literature and practice, as it is not a stable condition and often the illness and thus the impairment are episodic. The condition is often referred to as an “invisible” disability (Canadian Mental Health Association, report validation process).

Discrimination against women limits their upward mobility within organizations, and also affects their access to male-dominated occupations and sectors, such as the trades, technology, scientific, and technical fields. Consequently, the labour market is highly segregated along gender lines in all industrialized countries. Women entrepreneurs face obstacles to business startup and growth. These are based in part by traditional choice of sectors and the gender biases of some lenders (Gender Equality in the Labour Market Lessons Learned, HRDC, 2002).

Aboriginal people and immigrants face racism and biases, due to the lack of cultural awareness and tolerance of others.

Persons in receipt of income support and single parents face negative attitudes and reluctance from employers and institutions, based on stereotypes of their capabilities. Similarly, older workers experience stereotyping about their productivity and abilities to be retrained, and some face pressures to step aside for younger workers (Evaluation of Forestry Worker Bridging Program, Goss Gilroy, 2003).

Harassment (sexual and other) in the workplace leads to unsupportive work environments and additional stresses for those who lack the power and authority to complain and confront the situation.

### **Non-Standard Jobs**

Non-standard jobs include contract work, self-employment, temporary work and part-year work, or multiple jobs with a series of employers. Often this type of work is poorly paid and offers little or no job security. The growth in this type of work in Canada has been researched most recently and most extensively in relation to women in the workforce (Townson, 2003). Other research on persons with disabilities has noted that this group tends to be in part-time work (SLID, Statistics Canada). Non-standard work has consequences for both the short and longer-term economic security of workers, affects their incomes, eligibility for Employment Insurance, and access to benefits and pensions (Townson, 2003)

### **Underemployment**

The research noted two groups in particular that work in occupations for which they are overqualified based on their education. Foreign-born visible minorities experience greater education-occupation discrepancies compared to other groups - less than half of those with a university education have high skill level jobs (Knowledge Matters, HRDC, 2002).

A study on school to work transition for post-secondary graduates in Canada found that less than half of the graduates from fine arts, humanities, and social sciences felt that their jobs fit well with their program in terms of their credentials. The study concluded that employers tend to hire according to a presumed set of skills, rather than based on finding out what skills graduates bring to the job (The School to Work Transition, Post-Secondary Graduates, HRDC, 2001).

The data on earnings of various groups compared to the general workforce are indicators of the extent of exclusion in the labour market (see profiles in section 4.0).

### **Lack of Work Supports**

The critical importance of supports to the employment of people who require this form of assistance (particularly some persons with disabilities) has been well documented. Supports and services include such things as personal support from family, friends, and community organizations, co-workers; attendant care and home support services; and assistive devices, aids, and equipment for use at home and on the job.

Persons with disabilities bear many additional costs arising specifically from their disability. In many cases, these can be quite substantial. They may face considerable extra costs in accepting employment (such as extra transportation or personal assistance expenses) which could make employment uneconomical.

The inability to access needed quality rehabilitative services such as physiotherapy, speech therapy, and occupational therapy impacts significantly on the capacity to



acquire basic work related skills. Continued access to medical supports (including funding for medication) is an important issue. Access to these supports is also important to many persons in receipt of income support in making the transition to work (Labour Market Needs Analysis, Roeher 2002; Lessons Learned, HRDC; Roeher 1996).

Lack of job accommodation is another key barrier. This has been defined as “any modification of the workplace, or in the workplace procedures, that makes it possible for a person with special needs to do a job” (Canadian Mental Health Association, 1993). Accommodations include technical aids and devices and, as well, physical adaptations to the workplace, and adaptations to how work is structured.

Other forms of workplace supports are important to the job retention and advancement of other groups.

Women entering male-dominated occupations may require supports to help with integration to work places where they are breaking new ground. Their employers also need access to advice in order to best support their integration. Women also lack role models and mentors in occupations where they are under-represented. In some cases, equipment modifications are needed (Gender Equality in the Labour Market Lessons Learned, HRDC, 2002).

Persons in receipt of income support and single parents often require help with the costs of going to work, family, and other supports in adapting to the workplace.

Immigrants often need ongoing counselling and support services in the early years following arrival to help with labour force integration, particularly those needing licensure and assessment.

### **Barriers in the Community**

Access to the labour market is also affected by the availability of various supports and services in the community. The research reviewed highlighted three such barriers: lack of transportation, lack of accessible quality child care, and community capacity in general.

#### ***Lack of Transportation***

The availability of a community transportation system is a basic requirement for access to programs and services for all groups. The specific aspects that cause problems are:

**Physical accessibility:** This is an issue for persons with disabilities in areas with no accessible transportation systems.

**Availability:** This affects those with low income and those receiving income support, and those in rural areas.

**Geographic accessibility:** Those in rural areas often lack transportation to commute for training or work. Businesses also face higher transportation costs in some areas of the Province for shipping their product and receiving their supplies.

**Cost:** Groups at risk often cannot afford the transportation to get to programs and job interviews as a first step in getting back into the labour market.

In a recent provincial survey of income support recipients, transportation was a major barrier for unemployed recipients. Finding transportation was a problem for 41%. Affording it was a problem for 52% of those surveyed and 25% had difficulties with both. Most of those with difficulties were women (HRE, 2003).

Transportation problems are compounded if programs and services are located off the public transportation network.

### ***Lack of Accessible Quality Child Care and Elder Care***

The fact that a majority of Canadian mothers work does not necessarily mean that the existing system of child care is adequate. A national research paper indicated that there is an insufficient amount of affordable, high quality child care services for women who need or want it, and fees could be unaffordable. Good quality child care is less accessed by low-income Canadians despite the fact that they obtain greater benefit from it. Few employers offer child care on or near the worksite, and most of these are large employers, which excludes the large number of women working with small businesses (Gender Equality in the Labour Market Lessons Learned, Technical Report, HRDC, 2002). There is also a lack of adequate home care services and supports for persons with disabilities. As a result, family members (mainly women) provide this care in the home, rather than work.

A recent survey of income support recipients in the Province found that both finding and affording child care was a problem for a third of unemployed recipients (HRE, 2003).

As the population ages, increasing numbers of workers are responsible for caring for adult dependents. This, often in combination with child care duties, can cut short careers and impose serious time pressures on caregivers, who are most often women. Few employers provide benefits for elder care, and this is likely to become a predominant public policy issue in future.

### ***Community Capacity in Rural Areas***

Rural areas have experienced high levels of out-migration over the past decade. Youth in particular have been leaving, perceiving urban areas as offering more status and opportunities, they go for education and work and most do not plan to

return (R.A. Malatest and Associates, 2002). Combined with lower birth rates, the rural population is aging.

As populations decline, communities find it harder to provide the education options, services, and opportunities to attract the workers and investors who are needed to develop the economy. At the same time, the continual message about out-migration is undermining the confidence and sense of worth of those who choose to stay, and confidence of investors (Bristol Group, 2003).

The outlook of communities has been found to have an important impact on individuals. In times of major labour market adjustments (such as the cod moratorium), community attitudes and traditions have been found to affect the decisions of individuals on occupational change, education and training, and mobility (Evaluation of the Atlantic Groundfish Strategy, HRDC, 1997). Aboriginal people in disadvantaged communities have been found to often lack community support for their aspirations, including apathy and lack of successful role models (Congress of Aboriginal Peoples, 2001).

### **Barriers in the Home and Family**

The home environment underpins people's capacity to prepare for and participate in the labour market. A number of barriers can emanate from the home that have implications for public policies.

#### ***Work-Home Roles Imbalance***

This is very much a gender issue. There have been dramatic increases in the participation of women with children in the paid workforce over the past 30 years. This has not been matched in any country by a reallocation of domestic duties between men and women, and women continue to bear the primary responsibility for dependent care and household work in all industrialized countries (Gender Equality in the Labour Market Lessons Learned, HRDC, 2002).

Women face time pressures as they attempt to juggle work and family. They tend to have a more discontinuous labour market history than men as a result of their family responsibilities, and this can limit their earnings and their eligibility for Employment Insurance and employment programs, as well as workplace advancement. In dual-earner families, women are more likely than men to alter their employment patterns when they have children.

Although results indicate increased sharing of EI parental benefits between parents, women continue to be the primary caregiver. The majority of new parental EI claims in 2001-02 were for women (88.8%), marking a moderate decline from 92.7% in 2000-01 (2002 Employment Insurance Monitoring and Assessment Report, HRDC). Single parent women are less likely to participate in the labour market, although the proportion that do is rising (Statistics Canada).

One of the major obstacles to gender equality has been the failure of workplace and social institutions, historically organized around the male breadwinner model of the family, to keep pace with changing labour market trends (Gender Equality in the Labour Market Lessons Learned, HRDC, 2002).

### ***Family/Social Influences on Career Decisions***

Family members, peers, and others play a large role in the decisions that people make about whether to pursue further education and training, and their career choices. Perceptions of appropriate social and economic roles for young women, and low expectations of what persons with disabilities are capable of achieving, are two examples of barriers stemming from family influences.

For youth in general, plans to participate in post-secondary education are influenced by parental attitudes, family structure, and the parental socio-economic situation and occupations. Increasingly, parents are seen as key influencers who need access to good labour market information to be positive players in the career planning of their children (Canadian Policy Research Networks, 2001).

### ***Unstable Home Environment***

A stable, supportive home environment is an essential backdrop for people at work. It is difficult for people to direct their full efforts toward labour market preparation or participation when their basic needs are not being met or they have personal concerns about their home situation. Groups for which this is a particular issue are women, youth, and Aboriginal people.

Women who earn low incomes often find it more difficult to leave abusive relationships. This also prevents them from pursuing additional education or training (Women's Policy Office, report validation process).

Youth at risk are vulnerable to factors such as alcohol and drug abuse, and family relationships.

Aboriginal people face a disintegration of the traditional cultural and social values and practices which historically underpinned Aboriginal families and individuals. They experience higher rates of family breakdown including family violence, child neglect, and abuse than the general population (Congress of Aboriginal Peoples, 2001).

## ***5.2 Personal/Internal Barriers***

How well individuals fit with the labour market is also affected by what they bring in terms of personal characteristics. This section describes the key personal or internal traits that impede full participation. As with external barriers, not all groups or individuals within groups share these barriers.

## Multiple Barriers

Some groups are known to have multiple social and/or personal barriers from among those described below. Combined, these create even more significant challenges to being part of the labour market. Groups that are known to have more multiple barriers than average are youth at risk, single parents, and persons in receipt of income support. People with a criminal record face stigmatization in society and the labour market. Individuals with multiple barriers often require more intensive, extensive, and coordinated programs and services.

## Employability Skills

These include life skills such as confidence, self-esteem, commitment, readiness, job search skills, and independence of income support. A deficiency in these skills is to some extent a result of being in a disadvantaged situation. However, having these skills is important in order to move beyond being disadvantaged.

*Lack of confidence/self-esteem:* This is a barrier shared by many of the groups reviewed, stemming from self-perception of their abilities to succeed. This lack of confidence often results from past failures in studies or work, and is also reinforced by the perceptions and attitudes of others. The no job - no experience - no job dilemma leads to youth despondency, a lowering of self-esteem, and a sense of being disconnected. For some groups, it is a result of being socially isolated and not having the opportunity to learn the basic skills of interacting with others.

*Lack of commitment/motivation:* The more disadvantaged groups on income support often cannot find stable work that makes it worth the risk of leaving income support. This makes it difficult to be motivated (Reconnecting Social Assistance Recipients to the Labour Force, HRDC, 2000).

A proportion of high school students who do not go on directly to post-secondary do so because of reasons related to commitment and motivation, e.g., uncertainty about their plans or career choices, competing interests, lacking study skills or finances, lack of awareness of post-secondary education as an option, and perceptions that post-secondary education has a low payoff in the labour market. Yet in the workforce they face poor prospects (Canada Millennium Scholarships Foundation, Why Stop After High School, 2002).

*Employability/job search skills:* This is a barrier that crosses all groups, and is a particular issue for those with limited work experience and with little experience in making transitions in the labour market.

## Adult Literacy

Many adults have not learned to read well enough to obtain desirable jobs, to obtain training for these jobs, and to participate fully in society in general. This is a particular problem for those in the more disadvantaged groups - unemployed



youth, displaced older workers, Aboriginal people. Low levels of literacy and numeracy for these groups create added disadvantages along with the others they face in participating in the labour market (What Works for Whom?, HRDC, 1999).

Adults with literacy problems have an increased likelihood of suffering from learning disabilities and other reading problems, along with low self-esteem and associated social difficulties. Canadian adults in this group are said to have two-thirds the income of other Canadians, and are twice as likely to be unemployed, and much more likely to receive some form of income support. Adding to the problem, much of the written material used in schools and the workplace is unclear and unnecessarily complex (What Works for Whom?, HRDC, 1999).

### **Mismatch of Education and Skills with Opportunities**

Many people seeking to enter or re-enter the labour market find that their skills do not fit well with opportunities. This mismatch can occur for all groups and all education levels. Reasons include type and level of education, work experience, particular skill sets, credentials, or language skills.

#### **Education**

Education has been found to be the key factor influencing success in the labour market and well being in society more generally. There is a clear correlation between low educational attainment and problems making transitions in the labour market - for all groups and in all sectors (Knowledge Matters, HRDC, 2002). Low education also prevents people from taking part in programs to help address the barriers that they face (report validation process). An overall observation is that the best way to reduce unemployment over the long-term is to raise the level of educational attainment of secondary students and providing quality and affordable post-secondary education.

Youth - Young people with more education do better in the labour market than those with less education. The unemployment rate for youth with a university degree has remained stable, while the rate for those with less than high school or high school completion has risen dramatically (Statistics Canada). Equitable access to the labour market starts with equitable access to quality education. A key factor in this access is the cost of education (Canadian Policy Research Networks, 2001; Why Stop After High School?, Canada Millennium Scholarships Foundation, 2002; Investing in Learning - Investing in People, Government of Newfoundland and Labrador, 2002; Access Denied, Canadian Association of University Teachers, 2002).

Persons with disabilities - Research has demonstrated that persons with disabilities are less likely to obtain a post-secondary education. While Canada Student Grants offers help with exceptional costs, persons with disabilities often

take longer to finish a program and may have more difficulty finding employment, including summer employment to help finance their education. Many of the same barriers, e.g., lack of transportation and personal supports, that prevent persons with disabilities from participation in the labour force also reduce their ability to pursue education and training (Labour Market Needs Analysis, Roehrer 2002; Lessons Learned, HRDC; Roehrer 1996).

Aboriginal people - The education gap between Aboriginal people and non-Aboriginal people is pronounced. Many Aboriginal people also have poor outcomes in secondary school and this causes difficulty for this group in acquiring post-secondary education. Even those who hold high school and secondary school diplomas participate in the Canadian labour force at lower rates than non-Aboriginal people (Knowledge Matters, HRDC, 2002).

Students in rural areas - Family income and distance to a university have a substantial effect on participation rates. In a recent national survey, only 3% of students from low-income families living beyond commuting distance participated in university (Distance to School and University Participation, Statistics Canada, 2002).

### **Experience**

Those who have been out of the workforce for a while, those who are new to the country, and youth are all groups who commonly cite lack of experience or lack of relevant experience as obstacles to getting a first or new start. This lack of job experience places greater demands on the social welfare, health systems, and remedial training services.

### **Skill Sets**

The labour market places a premium on knowledge and skills. Workers who are making transitions today are doing so in a market that is rapidly changing. Knowledge-intensive occupations have grown at twice the average rate, and even traditional occupations are undergoing important skills upgrading. Workers who do not or cannot invest in the right training face difficulties in being competitive. Multi skilling is also of increasing importance as businesses seek to be competitive (Knowledge Matters, HRDC, 2002).

The new economy appears to be a gendered economy - women are not excluded, but their experiences are less positive than for men. Men are more intensive users of IT and come out ahead when it comes to the positive benefits of IT on job security. Contributors may be high technology use which is linked to longer hours at home, more intensified job demands, and spillover of work into the home - challenges that women find more difficult due to their responsibilities in the home (Hughes, Lowe and Schellenberg, Canadian Policy Research Networks, 2003).



Skills mismatch is a concern for older workers who may have skills that are no longer in demand or relevant for positions in growth industries and sectors.

More than ever before, language capital is a prerequisite for all occupations. This is a particular barrier for new immigrants who experience difficulty in learning new languages. As well, they may require sector specific language development and access additional levels of language training beyond the current level provided by government (Association for New Canadians, report validation process).

Even with the relatively high unemployment level in the Province, employers are increasingly finding it difficult to hire people with the right skills for their needs. Educational institutions are perceived as having difficulties keeping up with the requirements of the market. Not enough tradespeople are being trained. The education system in general is seen as biased toward the university track to the exclusion of the apprenticeable trades (Lowe and McMullen, Canadian Policy Research Networks, 1999).

Workplace training is not occurring as much as needed. Small businesses in particular lack training capacity, i.e., funding, time, the critical mass of staff to make it feasible, and perceptions that it is not a good investment). Employers themselves, particularly those in small businesses, are facing challenges in keeping their management skills current with an increasingly complex business environment (Canadian Federation of Independent Business, Canadian Manufacturers and Exporters, and RBC Financial Group, 2002).

### **Credentials**

The challenge for new immigrants is having their credentials recognized. Their credentials may need further accreditation and they often require licensure or extensive assessment and testing. These processes involve costs and often the accreditation services are not readily accessible (Immigration in Canada: A meeting of federal partners, 2003).

### **Health**

Both physical and mental health concerns can affect participation in the labour market.

One in three persons in receipt of income support indicated they had moderate to serious health problems in a recent survey (HRE 2003). Though not the most significant factor, the cost of prescription drugs is important in making the decision to seek work, and continued availability of the extended drug card does influence that decision. Loss of the drug card is particularly an issue for persons with mental health disabilities (HRE and Canadian Mental Health Association, report validation process).

Health problems, disabilities, and medical expenses are very inter-related and are not easily addressed. Programs would likely have to address all these in a holistic way in order for workers to be able to start and stay working.

### **Mobility**

Older workers are often less willing or able to be geographically or occupationally mobile for an employment opportunity. This is often for reason of cost, risk, or decisions being made on a household basis. (Older Worker Adjustment Programs, Lessons Learned, HRDC 1999).

Conversely, young people are more mobile for education and work, and this has implications for viability of some of the communities that they leave. There are mixed views on the appropriate and feasible strategies to address youth out-migration (encourage to stay or encourage to leave and develop opportunities for them to come back with expanded experiences and education).

The issue of inter-provincial barriers to labour mobility, in particular the recognition of occupational credentials, have been recognized and are being addressed through the Agreement on Internal Trade signed in 1994. More recently the issue of facilitating mobility for young workers has been a priority of The Forum of Labour Market Ministers.

### **5.3 Conclusions on Barriers**

The findings on barriers to labour market participation may be described as follows:

- A number of groups and individuals face complex and interrelated barriers that require significant assistance over the long term.
- Many barriers have similar causes but different effects on groups.
- Many barriers have similar effects but different causes
- Most barriers emanate from society and the labour market, not with the individuals and groups.

## 6.0 What Works

In this section, we turn to what has been learned on approaches that work in tackling the many and diverse barriers described. The good news is that there has been learning on what works (both in the Province and elsewhere). Labour market programming in the Province is already incorporating many of these lessons in main stream and group-specific initiatives.

It is important to note that many of the barriers workers face in participating in the labour market are often also barriers to their participating in programs designed to help. We begin with generic program features and follow this with findings on specific types of interventions. Where the findings relate to specific groups this is indicated. Where there are important limitations in what can be done, or significant evidence of when interventions do not work, this information is included.

### 6.1 What Works - Generic Design Features

The research undertaken for this study identified key design features in terms of transition programs that work in addressing labour market barriers. In this section, we describe each design feature, and how they are applied in practice.

#### Client-Centred

A client-centered approach involves individualizing the programming so that the needs, choices, interests, and preferences of the individual are discovered and acknowledged as valid, and where the opportunities for meaningful work are taken into consideration in the decision-making. There are several dimensions to client-centred programming:

*Inclusive:* Increasingly, programs are using a more inclusive model by involving participants in program design and review. Their input is essential, and in the main their involvement is sought directly or through third-party agencies which support them. Two examples of local programs that use participant and consumer input are the T. I. Murphy Centre (youth at risk) and the Independent Living Resource Centre (for persons with disabilities). Gender-based analysis and program design can also enhance program effectiveness. An example of an effective use of this approach is the Orientation to Trades and Technology Program of the Women in Resource Development Committee. This is showing encouraging results in terms of placements for graduates in the non-traditional jobs and in the resource-based sectors (several validators, report validation process).

Inclusive programs also empower individuals. An example is the National Strategy for the Integration of Persons with Disabilities (NSPID). The most successful program approaches tested within this strategy gave decision-making authority on resources to the individual consumer.

*Flexible:* A key feature of successful program design with many groups facing barriers (i.e. persons with disabilities, single parents, Aboriginal people, youth at risk, persons in receipt of income support, women) is an individualized and flexible approach, building upon the interests, experiences, and choices of clients, informed by the current and emerging opportunities in the labour market. For example, best results for persons on income support were achieved by programs utilizing a more balanced, multi-faceted approach with some clients starting with job search while others began with short-term education and training (Phase 1 Research Component of the Self-Sufficiency Project Newfoundland and Labrador, Final Report, Goss Gilroy Inc., 2002).

*Timing:* Early intervention is especially important to offset the dangers inherent in losing attachment to the labour market. This is particularly true of persons in receipt of income support, youth at risk, single parents, and Aboriginal people, where the risk of long-term dependence on the state is high. Involvement of all key stakeholders (e.g. employers, educational institutions, government, community) supports positive outcomes.

*Tailored:* The type, nature and degree of supports required by persons with barriers to obtain and keep employment is wide-ranging, and particular to the individual. Supports include help with skills development, job search, specific work supports, access to child care, clothing allowances, dealing with cultural issues, incentives to workers (e.g. supplements) and employers (e.g. wage subsidies), personal supports (e.g. counselling), and ongoing monitoring and support (Strategic Initiatives Program, Lessons Learned, HRDC, 2000).

*Service and resource co-ordination (often referred to in the literature as case management):* An approach of trained staff doing assessments and responding to the needs of groups facing barriers, at pre-employment, job search, and job maintenance stages, is linked to employment success generally. This is affirmed in some provincial examples, e.g., Single Parent Employment Program, NewfoundJOBS. This service and resource co-ordination approach is labour and resource intensive, but essential to ensure progress. This approach is most effective when it combines monitoring of progress and longer-term ongoing support, and where resources are available to respond to the needs identified.

*Accountability:* What distinguishes programs that work is a commitment by practitioners to serving clients and helping them move towards successful outcomes, i.e. going beyond meeting minimal formal requirements. In government and community-based delivery systems this means that specific efforts must be made, through staff selection, training, and monitoring, to ensure supportive service delivery and supports.

*Program management and culture:* These have been shown to matter with labour market programs for persons receiving income support in the literature reviewed (What Works for Whom?, HRDC, 1999). It is logical that these would be sound elements of programs for all groups. Superior programs convey high expectations,

have a strong focus on employment as the goal, set demanding performance standards for participants and staff, and have good management systems - in terms of human resource, delivery, and evaluation.

### **Preventative Approaches**

*Preventative* measures address the needs of those entering the labour market - particularly youth - or those re-entering, such as women. These are used for groups already accessing income support and at risk of long-term dependence, or youth in general making the transition from school to work. A holistic approach to prevention is important. For example, programs to prevent teenage pregnancy can be more effective than efforts to improve the labour market outcomes of teenage parents, particularly teenage parents who have dropped out of school (What Works for Whom?, HRDC, 1999).

On the other hand, *remedial* measures address the needs of people who are already dependent on income support or who have identified disadvantages, which prevented them from participating in the labour market. These measures involve tailored interventions to meet individual needs that go beyond preparation for work, and typically include assessment/employment counselling, skills development, work supports, pre-employment job finding skills, employment maintenance, and wage subsidies.

In most cases, remedial interventions are more intensive and lengthy than those in preventative programs. The literature indicates that preventative approaches may be expensive in the short-term, but more cost-effective in the long run.

The key preventative approach for all groups is improving education levels by ensuring that young people obtain a solid secondary and post-secondary education (What Works for Whom?, HRDC, 1999). One indicator of this from the provincial experience is the academic performance of the Fall 2002 high school graduates in their first year at Memorial University. This group had some of the strongest academic strengths since 1995 when annual tracking began. As in previous years, students with less than a 70% average in high school did not perform well in their first semester. This group is unique in that they had the benefit of writing high school public exams in both level 2 and level 3 (Rossiter, 2003).

### **Comprehensive**

Successful transition programs tend to include the following supports, either individually or collectively that address the specific needs of individual participants:

- education/training/skills development;
- employment preparation (counselling, resume writing, job shadowing/experience);



- personal/family supports.

Multi-faceted approaches are most effective in assisting groups experiencing significant barriers. Examples of successful approaches include:

- making programs accessible by responding to the barriers to participation;
- on-the-job training models that combine work and training for single parents, youth making transitions to further education / labour market, and youth at risk;
- providing a host of services not generally available to persons dependent on government income support (e.g. alcohol, drug, and mental health treatment; life skills training; self-esteem programs);
- combining culture and language development with job search assistance for immigrants and Aboriginal people;
- providing up front and ongoing supports to employers and co-workers of disadvantaged groups (e.g. sensitivity training, support in dealing with workplace behaviours, accommodations), and workplace follow up support for workers (e.g. for women entering non-traditional occupations);
- successful programs targeted to persons on income support include collateral supports: childcare support, transportation subsidies, extended health care benefits, and support for other incidental costs such as clothing, tools, haircuts, moving expenses, and emergencies - all issues that affect access to programs and work (Reconnecting Social Assistance Recipients to the Labour Force, HRDC, 2000).

### **Continuity**

Programming for people experiencing significant barriers works best when conceived and funded with multi-year approaches in mind. For example, long-term labour force attachment strategies are becoming the central focus of welfare reform, and these offer support over an extended period of time. There is evidence to support a preference for community service delivery, though this is tempered by the more precarious nature of community services in terms of their sustainability (What Works for Whom?, HRDC, 1999, SSPNL Research Report, 2002, Evaluation of NewfoundlandJOBS, 2001, KPMG, 1998).

If delivery is in the community, a clear commitment to sustainable funding is important, but lack of this is seen as one of the key weaknesses in much programming that is in place. In order for organizations to build their expertise to better address needs, they require longer-term support and funding that allows them to ensure client transitions are smooth and progressive. Funding existing good-performing organizations and helping them to build their infrastructures is superior to creating new services for each initiative. In the case of welfare reform,

this requires strong political leadership, embraced by the bureaucracy (SRDC, 2000, Gallant and Associates, 2000, 2002).

Coordination of service delivery across program areas and across jurisdictions is essential. Also important are integration of services and ease of transition from one to the other through solid inter-agency approaches, harmonized eligibility criteria and bridging programs. Coordination is especially important when people have multiple barriers and require assistance from several agencies (What Works for Whom?, HRDC, 1999).

### **Linkages to Good Jobs**

It has been shown for all groups that programming linked to work makes a difference in outcomes. Linkages to either entry-level and advancement opportunities are important for different groups.

*Entry-level* – For some populations such as youth or persons in receipt of income support, a chance to earn one's own money, and a supportive work experience where they learn about the world of work and obtain specific skills, matter more initially than the nature or long-term prospects of the jobs. For youth, the presence of an adult as mentor is important (What works with youth, Social Research Demonstration Corporation, 2000).

With supports and subsidization, people with significant barriers can work productively in positions suited to their capabilities, though this will decline when the subsidies and supports are reduced or removed. There are positive impacts on program participants (e.g. well being) and their children (e.g. educational attainment) from this attachment (From Phase 1 Research Component of the Self-Sufficiency Project Newfoundland and Labrador, Final Report, Goss Gilroy Inc., 2002).

*Advancement opportunities* – For people with more complex barriers (some persons in receipt of income support), linking employment initiatives to specific job opportunities, to growth occupations more generally, or further training has better long-term employment outcomes (SSPNL literature review, Goss Gilroy, 2002). The strength of this approach relies in part on the amount of the initial wage and the potential for higher wages beyond a rate where people are better off on assistance. Education is important for moving beyond low-wage jobs. The literature on persons in receipt of income support indicates that experiential, rather than classroom-based training is more effective for this group (Phase 1 Research Component of Self-Sufficiency Project, Goss Gilroy, 2002).

### **Focus on Partnerships**

Most successful initiatives involve partnerships with various agencies and the private sector. Successful partnerships involve a shared vision, shared resources and strengths and support of each other; shared responsibility and power for



program administration; frequent and honest communications and team effort. Clarity in roles, responsibilities, and accountabilities is necessary from the outset and important to be checked periodically as the partnership evolves (Transition Processes that Work, HRDC and Conference Board of Canada, 2001).

Follow through by government in setting clear direction and tangibly demonstrating continuing commitment is a key success factor when change is being introduced through partnerships processes. It is especially important that government stay the course on pilot projects when the policy environment and priorities of government are shifting. In partnerships with community-based organizations, clear and realistic expectations and a long-term-effort are important. Broad thinking and action are needed by organizations that play a lead role in order to leverage support and involvement of potential partners. There are some major constraints to establishing partnerships with non-profit organizations when they also take on a delivery role (Strategic Initiatives Program: Lessons Learned, HRDC, 2000).

To establish effective partnerships with the private sector, it is important for governments to *understand* the sector and their needs, think broadly in terms of their potential role, and maximize the leverage of the private sector investment. However, employer involvement is instrumental in design and implementation of programs (Strategic Initiatives Program: Lessons Learned, HRDC, 2000).

Ongoing commitment from, and inclusion of, the employer community is also key to longer-term success. In one study of successful transition models, all the exemplar programs engaged employers, and were employer-friendly. Key elements of making this involvement happen are outlined in the above paragraph (Transition Processes that Work, HRDC and Conference Board of Canada, 2001).

### **Community-Based**

Using locally available resources and opportunities to deal with local community challenges has been found to work. Individual communities tend to know their own situation best and build capacity based on their culture and challenges. Coordination of approaches among communities within regions is also seen as being important (Transition Processes that Work, HRDC and Conference Board of Canada, 2001)

## **6.2 What Works – Specific Interventions Dealing with Transition to the Labour Markets**

### **Education**

There is a strong correlation between educational attainment and success in the labour market. As stated earlier, education is perhaps the key success factor for all groups.

For young people, the principal source of labour market preparation remains the school system. Using the mainstream education systems has proven to be more efficient than building an alternative delivery infrastructure to deal with youth after they drop out of the school system. School-based programs tend to focus on prevention rather than remediation and aim to keep students in school, raise graduation rates, and build bridges to the labour market for those who are not destined for post-secondary education (What Works for Whom?, HRDC, 1999).

Effective interventions to increase graduation rates have included adult and peer mentoring, helping with homework, and offering small stipends for participation. Somewhat less successful have been programs providing remedial academic assistance during the summer. They help in the short-term but have not had much impact on graduation rates and subsequent employment (What Works for Whom?, HRDC, 1999).

The accessibility of post-secondary educational opportunities is also a key factor to success, and is affected by the costs of tuition and other expenses. The Province of Newfoundland and Labrador has made policy changes over the past several years to first freeze and later roll-back tuition fees, and recently initiated consultations regarding a debt reduction program. These measures are seen as a progressive step by students, but are not considered a full solution to the problem of rising costs (Missing Pieces IV, Canadian Centre for Policy Alternatives, 2003). The Province currently has the lowest tuition fees in the Atlantic Provinces and the fourth lowest in Canada (YSPSE).

The rising debt level of students and graduates is a major concern among all those with an interest in education and the labour market. The most recent available evaluation of the Student Loans Program was that conducted of the Canada Student Loans Program in 1996-97. It found that the program had fostered access, choice, and perhaps encouraged persistence in completion of post-secondary education. However, it concluded that the program was not well equipped to perform as well in future, in part because of the rising student debt levels. The report concluded that current approaches for designation of institutions were not satisfactory. Student loan default rates for institutions were proposed as potentially useful indicators for reviewing designation of institutions. Income contingent repayment was proposed as an appealing approach to dealing, in a limited way, with the problems associated with increasing levels of student debt. The experience in other countries provided evidence that this could be implemented on a large scale (Evaluation of the Canada Student Loans Program, HRDC, 1997).

Research has found that the use of vouchers to provide access to educational opportunities has significantly increased the number of income support recipients who go on to post-secondary education. This type of program must be carefully targeted as it has been found to have little impact on the decisions of participants who are not in receipt of income support (Strategic Initiatives: Lessons Learned, HRDC, 2000).

There is evidence on what works in literacy programs, but conditions do not always exist to allow that to happen consistently or systematically. Adult literacy programs aimed at specific groups seem to work better. Involvement of the learner in program design is also important (What Works for Whom?, HRDC, 1999).

The Random North Development Association is an example of a recent innovative approach in the Province. This project was designed to address problems with conventional approaches to literacy development, by linking academic upgrading with local work. Participants were placed in work settings in which literacy development was conducted, and which offered some prospects of a job and the end of training. The program overcame many of the personal and financial barriers to retention in literacy programs. Literacy achievements were not as successful, and a number of recommendations were made for future programming. The program was relatively costly, and projected pay back periods were high. Nevertheless, the program was seen as an innovative approach to linking education and work in a rural area (Evaluation of a Model and Pilot project in Linking Education and Development, Atlantic Evaluation and Research Consultants, 1999). It has since been expanded to several other sites for further development.

Access to Success is a model being piloted in the community college system. An evaluation found a high level of satisfaction with the program and evidence of better outcomes than have been historically achieved. The program was assessed positively for coherence, partnership, institutional setting and instructional approach, relatively high levels of support provided, absence of wait lists, higher participation rates, and improved outcomes relative to earlier ABE approaches (Investing in Learning - Investing in People, YSPSE, 2002).

## Training

The most significant financial investment in training in the Province is the Skills Development component of the Employment Benefits and Support Measures delivered under the Canada-Newfoundland and Labrador LMDA. A formative evaluation of this program, conducted in 2000, found strong evidence that the move away from a seat-purchase model has positively affected training decisions. There was a marked increase in the number of people taking training in business and information technology, and a decrease in take up in natural resources, applied arts, and appreciable trades. Two-thirds of clients surveyed said they had conducted labour market research regarding their career choices, and administrative data indicated an apparent reduction in dropout rates.

Most clients surveyed were satisfied with the level of assistance provided through the Negotiated Financial Assistance process. However, there were concerns raised in focus groups about the transparency and fairness of the process - both among clients and counsellors. Careful monitoring of the process was recommended (Formative Evaluation of EBSMs under the Canada/Newfoundland LMDA Phase 1, Goss Gilroy, 2000).

Training that is tailored to individual needs and circumstances produces better results. Aspects of tailoring that make for better training include: taking into account individual needs and circumstances with respect to duration and intensity of intervention; offering the training at convenient times, making the training accessible geographically, making special arrangements for persons with disabilities; providing prior learning assessment for immigrants who need this for credentials. Examples of tailoring from this province are the Orientation to Trades and Technology program and the Single Parent Employment Program.

Experiential training has been found to be more effective in helping people move from income support to work than classroom-based adult education, and it can lead to better jobs and higher earnings, but only for a minority of participants (typically those who already have at least a high school education). Labour force attachment strategies are less costly to run and are more effective for a broad cross-section of the potential participants (From Phase 1 Research Component of the Self-Sufficiency Project Newfoundland and Labrador, Final Report, Goss Gilroy Inc., 2002).

For Aboriginal people, sound education and training, integrated with cultural traditions, is essential to a long-term solution. Training is best accepted when participants see tangible results in the form of jobs and viable livelihoods. A parallel approach using the existing training infrastructure is best to provide Aboriginal youth the training they need to participate in the knowledge economy (What Works for Whom?, HRDC, 1999).

Training programs for out-of-school youth are most effective when they focus on occupations that are in demand, and when they are combined with other strategies such as job search and work experience (What Works for Whom?, HRDC, 1999).

Programs for older workers that work best are ones that keep workers in their field of experience, e.g., displaced loggers being placed in growth areas in related industry sectors; displaced trawlerpersons being retrained for jobs in the oil industry; and programs that fit local needs, since seeking employment elsewhere may be an unrealistic expectation beyond a certain age; and non-intensive training for workers nearing the end of their working careers (Evaluation of the Forestry Worker Bridging Program - draft report, Goss Gilroy, January 2003). For some older displaced workers, passive income support (not re-training) is most relevant (Fisheries Food and Allied Workers Union, report validation process).

### **School to Work Transition**

Holistic approaches work best in helping youth with disabilities make a successful transition from school to work for youth. There must be access to disability related aids and devices; adequate accommodation on-the-job; access to on the job training; adequate levels of personal support to manage daily living, and access to needed rehabilitation services. In addition, the following factors are important - building on individual choices of the youth and promoting individual motivation

and skill development; involving family members and friends in the transitional planning process; early planning in the high school years; keeping employers informed about the available pool of employees with disabilities, and adequate coordination of services (Lessons Learned from Evaluation of Disability Policy and Programs Technical Report, HRDC, 1997).

Effective program design for youth at risk is multi-faceted, allows for early intervention, and provides sustained adult contact with structure and motivation to do well. The provincial Linkages program focusses on at-risk youth who are ready for the labour market or for post-secondary education following participation in program. The program provides career counselling (group or individual) through a community agency, subsidized job placement and often a completion bonus. An evaluation found that features were relevant to the needs of the target group, but that the program was less effective for some sub-groups who needed additional collateral supports (Evaluation of Linkages Program, Goss Gilroy, 1999).

The effectiveness of programs for high school and post-secondary students (cooperative education, in school apprenticeship and summer employment) in affecting employment and earnings of graduates depends on the quality of the job experiences provided. The key is to provide experiences that will be valued in the full-time labour market (What Works for Whom?, HRDC, 1999). One notable example in the Province is the Women in Science and Engineering Summer Employment Program. This has provided work experience/job-shadowing opportunities for high school girls in the Province since 1990. The program has been shown to expand awareness of these non-traditional career choices, has influenced decisions about pursuing science, engineering and technology studies, and better prepared participants for their post-secondary studies. The program is characterized by quality work experiences in workplaces with adult mentors (Anthony, 1999).

There is some evidence that cooperative education programs at the post-secondary level are successful but more research is needed to assess the impact on high school students. There is evidence that measures to improve access to summer jobs can increase the employment of disadvantaged youth, however, these measures often attract youth who would have found jobs anyway. The impact on academic achievement and subsequent employment is unknown, and placement services for students are not any more effective than when youth use the regular services (What Works for Whom?, HRDC, 1999).

The role of guidance was examined in a recent study that focussed on four provinces, including Newfoundland and Labrador. It found that career and life planning occurs almost naturally in schools that provide programs involving collaboration with others in the community (eg. volunteering for school credit). Schools with these kinds of programs have reported increased aspirations for post-secondary education and students reporting their school experiences as more relevant and better at preparing them for the future. One province provided comprehensive



information sessions on all kinds of assistance using very knowledgeable workshop leaders. This has paid off in terms of increased knowledge of and access to financial aid, including bursaries. With this one exception, bursaries remain relatively hidden (Canada Career Development Foundation, 2003).

### **Employment Counselling and Assistance**

For all groups, specific interventions such as vocational counselling, training in job search skills, resumé writing, and job finding clubs are relatively inexpensive to operate and do seem to accelerate the process of finding a job. The modest benefits they achieve offset their costs. Lasting gains in employment are not produced by these offered alone, since they do not equip people to advance in the labour market (What Works for Whom?, HRDC, 1999). It is important that counselling be sensitive to the needs of various groups, and be inclusive of all the options available (e.g. trades occupations for women).

Active employment and adjustment services, requiring active client involvement can *assist* in the re-employment of older workers. Components of adjustment programs, e.g., job placement, locally-based training, and peer counselling are effective when tailored specifically to the individual older worker's needs and when they provide a high degree of guidance and support. Those programs with a job developer function (personal contact with local employers) had the highest placement rates (What Works for Whom?, HRDC, 1999).

Programs for income support recipients that use job search, education, and training, and an emphasis on getting people into jobs relatively quickly are most cost effective whereas, those with job search, education and training as separate pursuits are sub-optimal (What Works for Whom?, HRDC, 1999).

### **Work Incentives/Supplements**

Welfare-to-work programs can achieve positive results, although often modest, but they also have important limitations. They can increase employment and earnings of a broad cross-section of the income support caseload and reduce costs but those with multiple barriers are unlikely to be helped. They have not usually increased overall incomes as increases are often offset by reductions in benefits. Many remain on income support and the incidence of job loss is a problem. Often there is cycling on and off welfare (What Works for Whom?, HRDC, 1999).

Successful programs convey high expectations, have a focus on employment as the goal, provide support for work, set demanding performance standards for clients and staff, involve private sector, enrol a diverse mix of the client population (where this is applicable), and have good management systems (What Works for Whom, HRDC, 1999). Support for work could range from maintenance and mentoring type supports, through to assistance with child care, transportation, and clothing costs.

The Newfoundland and Labrador Single Parent Employment Program (SESP) helps illustrate this approach. SESP focusses on single parent women receiving income support, consists of basic job readiness training, facilitation of acquisition of job search skills, provision of job related supports, personal supports during transition to employment, and an Earned Income Supplement (to a maximum of \$300 per month). It was found that a combination of barriers more so than any one barrier prevented labour force participation. Addressing the barriers and providing the necessary supports - not fixing the person - was key to success.

Evaluation results of SESP show that single parents who had worked in the 12 months prior to their involvement with the program were most likely to be employed. The salaries and hours of work of participants increased over time, and the majority of jobs found were of a part-time and permanent nature. Program strengths included: participant empowerment, dedicated staff, client job readiness training when used in conjunction with access to appropriate supports, job search, placement and follow up support and delivery by a third sector agency. The Income Supplement was viewed as an adequate incentive to obtain and retain employment (Gallant and Associates, Summative Evaluation of the Single Parent Employment Support Program, 2002).

Work incentive/supplement programs have been found to substantially increase the employment, hours of work, earnings, and total income of long-term welfare recipients. Program designs that coupled incentives with full time employment requirements, in combination with employment services, produced the largest impacts. No evidence was found of any unintended reductions in work effort among working poor. Earnings supplements encouraged work, and the increased income obtained typically led to a substantial decrease in poverty. Increased income improved participants' well-being in the form of greater expenditures on food, children's clothing, housing, and less reliance on food banks (Phase 1 Research Component of the Self-Sufficiency Project Newfoundland and Labrador, Final Report, Goss Gilroy Inc., 2002).

Programs that included earnings supplements (and led to associated increases in parental employment and income) had positive effects on elementary school-aged children, including higher school achievement, reduced behavioural problems, increased positive social behaviour and/or improved children's overall health. The positive effects of earnings supplement programs were most pronounced for children of long-term welfare recipients (Phase 1 Research Component of the Self-Sufficiency Project Newfoundland and Labrador, Final Report, Goss Gilroy Inc., 2002).

The Self Sufficiency Project (SSP) is a social security reform demonstration project operating in New Brunswick and British Columbia. It tests whether welfare recipients can be encouraged to work full-time through a financial incentive. SSP offers a generous, but time limited, earnings supplement to recipients who leave income support and who work at least 30 hours per week. It is directed at single parents receiving income assistance for at least one year.



The SSP has been the subject of several evaluations. Overall indications are that the SSP increased full time employment, earnings, and income, and reduced poverty. One third of the long-term welfare recipients who were offered the SSP earnings supplement took up the offer. The effects of the SSP on employment, welfare use, and income were small after parents were no longer eligible for the supplement. Elementary school aged children in the program group performed better in school than similar children in the control group.

A second project (SSP Plus) combined the SSP earnings supplement with services to help people find and keep jobs. This resulted in larger effects than did the earnings supplement alone. However, although more people found jobs as a result of the additional services offered in the SSP Plus program, they had difficulty holding these jobs. The evaluation concluded that follow-up services provided by the SSP Plus staff may have been inadequate.

For persons in receipt of income support, financial incentives can encourage work and have an anti-poverty effect, however, the net effect on public expenditures is uncertain since some clients receive transfer payments longer. Financial incentives seem to be more effective when combined with strong Welfare-to-Work programming, as the two approaches can be mutually reinforcing (From Phase 1 Research Component of the Self-Sufficiency Project Newfoundland and Labrador, Final Report, Goss Gilroy Inc., 2002).

## **Wage Subsidies**

In general, the Canadian experience with wage subsidies suggests relatively large positive impacts on employment and earnings for participants. However, there are losses experienced by those displaced by these same participants. The literature suggests that wage subsidy programs mainly redistribute job opportunities (the Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development suggests only one job in five is created as a result of the subsidy). However, the argument is made that this redistribution may be justified on equity grounds as long as the people displaced are not members of disadvantaged groups (What Works for Whom?, HRDC, 1999).

The wage subsidy program design varies widely and includes lump-sum payments, flat rate and graduated rates of wage reimbursement, front-end and back-end loaded subsidies, or bonuses linked to training. Simplicity of the program is an important concern for employers.

Wage subsidy programs for income support recipients have generally been found to have better success if they are of sufficient length (six to nine months) and are simple for employers. They must be well advertised, provide job search assistance to clients. Readiness for work and early intervention are also key (What Works for Whom?, HRDC, 1999).

For persons with disabilities, wage subsidies work best when provided in conjunction with an individualized, co-ordinated planning approach, and include other forms of support to both the individual and employer, and follow up and monitoring are provided (Lessons Learned from Evaluation of Disability Policy and Programs Technical Report, HRDC, 1997).

In 2002, a review was conducted of the various wage subsidy programs of Human Resources and Employment, including NewfoundJOBS, SWASP, Linkages, and the Graduate Employment Program. The programs were found to be generally consistent with the literature in terms of extending the length of subsidies to one year or more; that effort was needed to improve program delivery and effectiveness outside St. John's (including engagement of private sector employers, and pre/post placement supports); and that incentives for income support clients to remain employed were needed, similar to those provided in the Single Parent Employment Program.

The Employment Generation Program involves a longer-term placement (60 weeks) which is considered a strength, but there are concerns about deadweight loss, its employer-centred focus, and that the income support recipient participation levels (17%) were an indication that it is not inclusive of this group.

The strength of Linkages (for at-risk youth) were seen to be its connection with and reliance on community resources, although the capacity of organizations to take on administration was seen as being taxed.

The strengths of the Graduate Employment Program were its duration (52 weeks), substantial wage subsidy, and effort to match employers and graduates. Deadweight loss was a concern especially since the program is seen as serving a relatively advantaged group.

Overall, the review found that these programs were positive tools for stimulating employment for priority clients, and that their effectiveness would be enhanced as the other components required were developed (Evaluation of NewfoundJOBS/Wage Subsidy Review, IHRD Group and Goss Gilroy, 2002).

The HRDC Targeted Wage Subsidy program has been found to have short-term employment benefits for participants. Participants surveyed in 2000 (within a year after program completion for most) were employed 64% of the time since their wage subsidy ended, with males having better outcomes than females. (Formative Evaluation of EBSMs under the Canada/Newfoundland LMDA Phase 1, Goss Gilroy, 2000).

### **Employment/Work Experience**

Job creation programs offering temporary periods of work have generally failed to provide long-term benefits to participants in terms of getting and keeping a job (What Works for Whom?, HRDC, 1999).

For persons in receipt of income support, work experience programs are most effective when they are temporary, focus on marketable skills acquisition, and support clients in resolving personal issues (H. Roberston, 1994). In a formative evaluation of EBSMs, participants surveyed in the HRDC Job Creation Partnerships Program had not realized short-term employment gains after project participation. Key informants interviewed as part of this evaluation indicated that such gains would not be expected. They saw the primary focus of this benefit being to support economic development and to provide short-term employment (Formative Evaluation of EBSMs under the Canada/Newfoundland LMDA Phase 1, Goss Gilroy, 2000).

### **Bridging Programs**

Bridging programs aimed at women re-entering the labour market, those in receipt of income support, and those facing other barriers can help overcome barriers to labour market participation. Typically bridging programs include counselling services, life skills training, basic academic training, combined with job search skills, training in interview techniques and a strong emphasis on work placements. The Women in Successful Employment (WISE) program in Newfoundland and Labrador was found to be highly successful in helping with career decision-making and improved self-confidence (Abraham Ross, 1994).

The Forestry Worker Bridging Program, a pilot approach operated in the Province, focussed on providing employment alternatives for older workers in rural areas whose skills were no longer in demand, through a multi-faceted approach to alternate employment within the sector, non-intensive training, and financial support to employers. The program met the needs of both employers and workers well in a cost-effective manner. Long-term benefits are expected to be both commercial and social (Evaluation of the Forestry Worker Bridging Program - draft report, Goss Gilroy, 2003).

### **Self-Employment**

Own-account self-employment refers to self-employed people who usually do not hire other staff, and includes incorporated and unincorporated businesses. In Canada and all regions, own-account self-employment has grown faster than total employment over the past two decades. Growth was also more significant for women and youth. The growth can be attributed to a shift to services, where there are more self-employment opportunities and a general rise in self-employment in all sectors. Continued growth in the future is likely (Own-Account Self-employment in Canada: Lessons Learned, HRDC, 2000). Lessons learned from this HRDC study included that opportunities for government assistance exist, but there are different views on approaches to take. Entrepreneurs are a diverse group - some need only a better business climate; others need help with start-up, financing, support training, access to benefits and advice, capacity to use technology.

There are a wide array of programs available to meet these needs, but better advertising is needed. Young people have different expectations and needs than older workers, and may be better equipped in terms of skills and their education to work in a flexible employment relationship. Success factors include the personal traits of individuals, access to informal peer networks for support, relevant government programs including access to financing, and strategic use of technology (Own-Account Self-employment in Canada: Lessons Learned, HRDC, 2000).

Other studies of self-employment programs have shown the importance of combining financial assistance with other types of support, such as management training and business planning help. Businesses started through these kinds of programs have generally had survival rates that are in line with other new business start ups. There is a risk of deadweight loss, i.e., the business would have started anyway, but an evaluation of the Graduate Self-Employment Program in Newfoundland and Labrador found that 75% of successful starters indicated they would not have opened the business without assistance from the program - better than the results in other programs (ARC Consultants, 1998).

Participants in the HRDC Self-Employment Benefit have shown positive short-term post-program results. Participants had been operating their business or employed for 89% of the time since the HRDC funding support ended. The statistical regression models indicated that participants were in business or employed 35% more than would be expected (Formative Evaluation of EBSMs under the Canada/Newfoundland LMDA Phase 1, Goss Gilroy, 2000).

Initiatives which support self-employment or entrepreneurship show riskier but equal or more favourable earnings outcomes compared to paid employment for persons with disabilities (What Works for Whom?, HRDC, 1999).

### **Transition to Retirement**

A number of approaches have been tried for older workers to ease the transition from work to retirement. Income support programs are a passive means of helping older workers and appear to be effective in ensuring financial security for older workers who have suffered a job loss. A Canadian study showed that Employment Insurance benefits enabled workers to conduct a more thorough job search and resulted in higher wages in their new jobs (What Works for Whom?, HRDC, 1999).

In Canada, France, and Australia, relatively generous income support programs have enabled older workers to withdraw from the labour market with minimal loss of income. However, alternatives to income support, such as work sharing, part-time employment and phased retirement have allowed older individuals to maintain their attachment to the labour force and continue receiving some employment income. This reduces the emotional and financial shock often associated with full retirement (What Works for Whom?, HRDC, 1999).

## 6.3 What Works - Specific Interventions in the Workplace

### Employment Standards

Employment standards are designed to protect workers from possible exploitation in unregulated labour markets. They govern wages, working conditions, benefits and leaves, hours of work, and protection for unjust dismissal. They may be set out in legislation, collective agreements, and voluntary codes of conduct. The research on employment standards points out more about what needs to be done to strengthen their effectiveness for vulnerable workers (particularly those in non-standard work), than it does on what works.

It is known that effectiveness of standards is enhanced by strong monitoring and enforcement mechanisms. Existing federal and provincial government legislation in Canada has been criticized in this regard. The legislation is rarely enforced adequately, and the complaints process has its limits (Gender Equality in the Labour Market Lessons Learned, HRDC, 2002).

One good example of effective monitoring is the “No Sweat” campaign in the United States targeted at the garment industry and which includes enforcement, education/outreach, and recognition. Since 1995, it has reduced overtime and minimum wage violations. Further examination of what makes it work would help in determining how transferable the approach is to Canada (Gender Equality in the Labour Market Lessons Learned, HRDC, 2002).

The following have also been suggested as means of strengthening employment standards legislation and practices:

- joint and several liability between employers to make contractors, sub-contractors, and immediate employers legally liable for violations;
- the right to make anonymous and third-party complaints to mitigate fears of reprisals; and
- more strenuous reporting and record-keeping practices.

Broadly based (sector wide) collective bargaining in Europe has helped with coverage of non-standard workers who move among employers and industries.

Voluntary codes are gaining more interest, but there is little evidence on their effectiveness (Gender Equality in the Labour Market Lessons Learned, HRDC, 2002).

### Employment Equity

In many countries equal opportunity policies have been implemented only recently, and there has been little systematic evaluation of their results. However, there is some evidence that Affirmative Action programs in the United States



have increased women's employment and earnings and improved job retention. Canadian employment equity legislation is relatively new. Preliminary results show a small positive effect on representative hiring for at least some groups of females (Caucasian women appear to benefit the most). However, the effectiveness of policies that clearly state the type and magnitude of the changes expected, timetables for achievement, and penalties for non-compliant organizations is shown in annual reports on the program (Gender Equality in the Labour Market Lessons Learned, HRDC, 2002).

Research on persons with disabilities, shows that those responsible for barriers may occasionally remove them out of goodwill or out of desire to expand market share, but there is no proof that awareness campaigns and public relations campaigns have had more than a marginal impact. As a result, there is a clear international trend in all industrial, and many developing countries, to enact barrier removal legislation (Disabilities Policies and Programs, Lessons Learned, HRDC, 1997).

### **Pay Equity**

Pay equity policies and legislation can be effective in reducing the gender gap in pay. These policies share the principle that jobs that are qualitatively dissimilar in nature can nevertheless be compared in terms of skill, effort, responsibility, and working conditions through a methodology of job evaluation. The most recent and significant Canadian example of pay equity impacts is the 1999 settlement between the federal government and the union which represents clerical workers and several other female-dominated job categories. This settled a 16 year-old dispute. Under the agreement, some 230,000 current and former employees received between \$3.3 and \$3.6 billion, as well as changes to benefits and ongoing pay equity adjustments.

However, several factors can restrict the capacity of pay equity schemes: male comparators are absent in some workplaces; pay equity does not apply to women in male-dominated or mixed occupations; and pay equity is restricted to the public sector in most jurisdictions.

Policies that narrow the overall earnings distribution narrow the gender earnings gap. Several researchers have noted that the relatively more decentralized wage setting system in Canada and the United States accounts for the larger gender pay differentials. By contrast, Australia and many European countries have a long tradition of centralized wage determination involving a dominant sector, and strong collective bargaining (Gender Equality in the Labour Market Lessons Learned, HRDC, 2002).

### **Workplace Training**

For persons in receipt of income support and single parents, on-the-job training models lead to positive long-term results when several conditions are in place:



employment is the first or an early intervention as opposed to the goal of a program; the on-the-job experience is combined with creative training programs; and employers work closely with governments and educational institutions to link pre-employment training to post-training employment opportunities (What Works for Whom?, HRDC, 1999).

## **Work Supports**

A number of studies reviewed noted features of successful programs and/or policies which acknowledge that many people may require supports in order to work. In many cases, individual programs fall short of offering the whole basket of supports, along with the other generic features of successful programs noted earlier in this report. The following is a synthesis of lessons learned - both what has been observed to work in individual programs, as well as what needs to be done - but is not necessarily well done now.

A co-ordinated, holistic approach works well when issues such as employment, transportation, housing and living arrangements, personal support, income support, and access to rehabilitation and training are not approached as individual issues.

Provision of ongoing case management services to assist former welfare recipients to adjust to the workplace, deal with personal and work related problems, and access support as needed to navigate the social service networks are effective.

Programs that include supportive payments or loans to offer short-term assistance and services to working families to address emergency situations that might otherwise lead to job loss have shown results.

Involvement of employers is key, and barriers need to be addressed directly.

Mentoring programs that provide new entrants to the workforce with assistance in issues such as time management and workplace stress, balancing work and home commitments, budgeting, and appropriate workplace behaviour are effective for income support recipients.

For persons with disabilities, one of the keys to success is the provision of up front and ongoing supports to the employer (e.g. sensitivity and awareness training, support in dealing with inappropriate behaviours, workplace accommodations, etc.).

Workplace accommodations can enable many people with disabilities to be employed in regular employment settings. Contrary to common perceptions, most accommodations are not costly, with half costing less than \$250 and many not involving any cost (What Works for Whom?, HRDC, 1999).

Individuals (particularly those with psychiatric disabilities) who have been most successful at finding satisfying work were those who were supported in viewing their entry or re-entry into the mainstream workforce as a longer-term goal, and not as a one-step process. Individuals who were most successful at finding and keeping work were those who continued to receive both formal (e.g. mental health providers, vocational rehabilitation counsellors, therapists, etc.) and informal support (e.g. friends, family, self-help/peer groups), whether directly within their work environment or outside of work (Educational Planning and Design Associates, 1994).

### **Supported Employment Model**

For persons with disabilities, alternatives such as supported employment are proven to work better than previous traditional approaches such as sheltered work. The Supported Employment model (usually used with persons with intellectual disabilities) involves training and work at a job site with the help of a job coach. It has achieved a high level of consumer satisfaction and is less costly than alternatives (Lessons Learned from Evaluation of Disability Policy and Programs Technical Report, HRDC, 1997).

### **Disability Management and Return to Work Strategies**

Successful strategies for persons who experience disabilities include redesign of the worksite, flexible or variable work schedules, or assignment to a different job suitable to capabilities. Success was also experienced when greater emphasis was given to self employment options. Overall, success in return to work programs is increased when interventions occur early (the longer the person is away from the job the less likely to return), when a proactive case management process is used, and when there is a recognition that workplace accommodation may be necessary to enable re-entry. Where programs are not effective, it appears to be linked to a lack of accountability (as costs are usually incurred elsewhere in government), lack of interest in persons with disabilities, or lack of belief that they are re-employable (Lessons Learned from Evaluation of Disability Policy and Programs Technical Report, HRDC, 1997).

## **6.4 What Works for Employers**

As noted in the introduction to this report, we examined literature related to labour market barriers faced by employers, which are of a different nature than those faced by workers. The key barriers for employers identified in this research are looming skill shortages and lack of effective workplace training strategies, as well as systemic barriers in the business environment caused by government regulation. We identified lessons on the first two, along with indications of a recent innovation in the Province that is helping with broader business development issues.









































































